



**Department of Engineering
and Public Works**

P.O. Box 21229

West Palm Beach, FL 33416-1229

(561) 684-4000

FAX: (561) 684-4050

www.pbcgov.com



**Palm Beach County
Board of County
Commissioners**

Gregg K. Weiss, Mayor

Maria Sachs, Vice Mayor

Maria G. Marino

Michael A. Barnett

Marci Woodward

Sara Baxter

Mack Bernard

County Administrator

Verdenia C. Baker

*"An Equal Opportunity
Affirmative Action Employer"*

Official Electronic Letterhead

August 11, 2023

**To: HBC Engineering Company
REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineers**

**Subj: August 10, 2023, Selection Committee Results
Street Lighting System Design and Related Inspection (CEI)
Professional Continuing Services Contract
on a Consultant Service Authorization Basis
Project No.: 2023051**

Dear Consultants:

This letter serves to advise you of the results of the August 10, 2023, Selection Committee for the above referenced project. The firm that has been selected is: **HBC Engineering Company.**

Consultants are hereby notified of the "Cone of Silence" requirements pursuant to Palm Beach County Lobbyist Registration Ordinance 2003-055.

In accordance with Palm Beach County PPM #CW-O-048, the results of the Selection Committee meeting shall be reported in writing to the Board of County Commissioners (Board). If any member of the Board has not requested to review the ranking of the Selection Committee Meeting within ten (10) business days of such report, it shall be deemed that the Board has affirmed the selection. The selected firm will be contacted to schedule a scope of services meeting and begin negotiations.

The enclosed Award Recommendation will be posted at the Engineering & Public Works Department / Roadway Production Reception area on the 3rd Floor at 2300 North Jog Road, West Palm Beach, Florida on August 14, 2023. If your office wishes to protest the award recommendation, you may do so by addressing your protest to Ms. Melody Thelwell, Director, Palm Beach County Purchasing Department, 50 South Military Trail, West Palm Beach, Florida 33415. Failure to submit a protest to the Director of Purchasing within five (5) business days after posting of the Award Recommendation, as prescribed in Section 2-55(b) of the Palm Beach County Code, shall constitute a waiver of proceedings under the referenced County Code.

Thank you for your time in presenting your approach for this project. We



**August 10, 2023, Selection Committee Results
Street Lighting System Design and Related Inspection (CEI)
Professional Continuing Services Contract
on a Consultant Service Authorization Basis
Project No.: 2023051
August 11, 2023**

encourage you to submit on future projects. Should you have any questions or require additional information please contact me at 561-684-4122 or at hknight@pbcgov.org.

Sincerely,

Holly B. Knight, P.E.
Contracts Section Manager

Attachments:

1. Compilation of Selection Committee Votes
2. Selection Committee Meeting Minutes
3. Selection Committee Voting Ballots
4. Selection Consultant Summary of Teams
5. OEBO Participation Evaluation Form
6. Sign-in Sheet

ec: with Attachments

Patrick Rutter, Assistant County Administrator
David L. Ricks, P.E., County Engineer, Engineering & Public Works
Joanne M. Keller, P.E., Deputy County Engineer, Engineering & Public Works
Steven B. Carrier, P.E. Assistant County Engineer, Engineering & Public Works
Morton L. Rose, P.E., Director, Roadway Production, Engineering & Public Works
Kathleen O. Farrell, P.E., Asst. Director, Roadway Prod. Div., Eng. & Public Works
Holly B. Knight, P.E., Contracts Mgr, Roadway Prod. Div., Eng. & Public Works
Motasem Al-Turk, P.E., Director, Traffic Division, Engineering & Public Works
Fattoush Jafar, P.E., Manager, Traffic Eng Ops, Traffic Div, Eng & Public Work
May Cheng, P.E., Traffic Division, Engineering & Public Works
JaeAnn Dean, Technical Assistant II, Roadway Prod. Div., Eng. & Public Works
Kenny Rampersad, Director, Admin. Services Div., Eng. & Public Works
Danny Ramlalsingh, Fiscal Manager, Admin. Services Div., Eng. & Public Works
Ali Bayat, P.E., Director, Water Utilities Department
Henry Melendez, P.E., CIP Project Manager, Water Utilities Department
Irwin Jacobowitz, Director, Contract Development and Control
Fanny Amini, Contract Analyst, Contract Development and Control
Tonya Johnson, Director, Office of Equal Business Opportunity (OEBO)
Allen Gray, Small Business Development Mgr, OEBO
Angela Smith, Small Business Development Specialist, OEBO
Melody Thelwell, Director, Purchasing Department
Samara Cooper, Assistant Director, Purchasing Department
CCNA File

COMPILATION OF SELECTION COMMITTEE VOTING BALLOTS

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE:

Street Lighting System Design and Related Inspection (CEI)
Professional Continuing Services Contract on a Consultant Service
Authorization Basis

PROJECT NO: 2023051

MEETING DATE: Thursday, August 10, 2023

MEETING TIME: 10:30 A.M.

TOTALS / RANKINGS			
Total points from each voting member and associated rank of firm.			
Selection Committee	HBC Engineering Company		REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineering
David Ricks	93	1	73 2
Henry Melendez	89	1	70 2
Fanny Amini	95	1	75 2
Motasem Al-Turk	95	1	80 2
Allen Gray	89	1	76 2
Fattoush Jafar	90	1	75 2
TOTAL		6	12
RANK		1	2

JaeAnn Dean
Secretary Name Printed


Secretary Signature

CRITERIA:

Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the requirements of the project.

MAX SCORE

35

Selection Committee	HBC Engineering Company	REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineering
David Ricks	34	33
Henry Melendez	32	30
Fanny Amini	35	35
Motasem Al-Turk	35	35
Allen Gray	32	34
Fattoush Jafar	35	35

CRITERIA:

Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of written response, including meeting schedule requirements.

MAX SCORE

35

Selection Committee	HBC Engineering Company	REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineering
David Ricks	34	30
Henry Melendez	32	30
Fanny Amini	35	30
Motasem Al-Turk	35	35
Allen Gray	32	32
Fattoush Jafar	30	30

CRITERIA:

Location of the firm's offices where work will be accomplished.

MAX SCORE

3

Selection Committee	HBC Engineering Company	REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineering
David Ricks	3	0
Henry Melendez	3	0
Fanny Amini	3	0
Motasem Al-Turk	3	0
Allen Gray	3	0
Fattoush Jafar	3	0

CRITERIA:

State Certified MBE (2 points for state certified MBE primes and/or subconsultants)

MAX SCORE

2

Selection Committee	HBC Engineering Company	REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineering
David Ricks	2	0
Henry Melendez	2	0
Fanny Amini	2	0
Motasem Al-Turk	2	0
Allen Gray	2	0
Fattoush Jafar	2	0

CRITERIA:

EBO Program Evaluation preference as applied by the GSC. APIs for this contract are: SBE Evaluation Preference. Ord. Ref.: 2-80.27(3)(d)(option 1).

MAX SCORE

15

Selection Committee	HBC Engineering Company	REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineering
David Ricks	15	0
Henry Melendez	15	0
Fanny Amini	15	0
Motasem Al-Turk	15	0
Allen Gray	15	0
Fattoush Jafar	15	0

CRITERIA:

Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past 4 years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)

MAX SCORE

10

Selection Committee	HBC Engineering Company	REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineering
David Ricks	5	10
Henry Melendez	5	10
Fanny Amini	5	10
Motasem Al-Turk	5	10
Allen Gray	5	10
Fattoush Jafar	5	10

FINAL SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Street Lighting System Design and Related Inspection (CEI) Professional Continuing Services Contract on a Consultant Service Authorization Basis Project No. 2023051

Thursday, August 10, 2023

Called to Order: 10:35 A.M.

Adjourned: 11:51 A.M.

Engineering & Public Works Dept., 2300 N. Jog Road, 1st Floor Conf. Room #VC-1E-58/59

MEMBERS PRESENT:

David Ricks, P.E.	- County Engineer, Engineering & Public Works
Henry Melendez, P.E.*	- CIP Project Manager, Water Utilities Department
Fanny Amini**	- Contract Analyst, Contract Development & Control, OFMB
Motasem Al-Turk, P.E.	- Director, Traffic Division, Engineering & Public Works
Allen Gray***	- Small Business Development Manager, Office of Equal Business Opportunity
Fattoush Jafar, P.E.	- Manager, Traffic Engineering Operations, Traffic Division

* denote any delegated votes here:

*Ali Bayat, P.E.	- Director, Water Utilities Department
**Irwin Jacobowitz	- Director, Contract Development & Control, OFMB
***Tonya Johnson	- Director, Office of Equal Business Opportunity

DISCUSSION:

Quorum was present and represented by a minimum of four members at least two of which are engineers.

The Final Selection Committee was called to order by David Ricks, P.E., County Engineer. It was stated that the committee would be selecting a firm for professional engineering consulting services for the Street Lighting Design and Related Inspection (CEI) Professional Continuing Services Contract.

The meeting was opened up the meeting for public comments, public was present but none had questions or comments.

Opening discussion identifying and outlining the project requirements was given by Fattoush Jafar, P.E., Manager, Traffic Engineering Operations, Traffic Division and Motasem Al-Turk, P.E. Director. Traffic Division. The outline stated what the work entailed, and what the committee should be looking for in the presentations by the firms.

Final Selection Committee Meeting Minutes (cont.)
Project Street Lighting Design and Related Inspection (CEI) Professional Continuing Services Contract on a Consultant Service Authorization Basis

August 11, 2023

The order of business was to select one consultant.

Each consultant made a presentation of their qualifications before the Final Selection Committee and answered questions from committee members.

At the end of the presentations David Ricks, P.E., County Engineer stated that the public is welcome to make comments or sit and observe the discussions. HBC Engineering Company and REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineers were present.

Committee discussed each presentation and the project and then voted.


RESULTS:

The Final Selection Committee voting resulted in the following ranking order of the consultants:

1. **HBC Engineering Company** *(Selected Consultant)*
2. REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineers

SELECTION EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE:	All Engineering Services Required for:
	Street Lighting System Design and Related Inspection (CEI) Professional Continuing Services Contract on a Consultant Service Authorization Basis
PROJECT NO:	2023051
SELECTION MEETING DATE:	Thursday, August 10, 2023
SELECTION MEETING TIME:	10:30 A.M.

Criteria	Max Score	HBC Engineering Company	REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineers
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the requirements of the project.	35	34	33
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of written response, including meeting schedule requirements.	35	34	30
Subtotal	70	68	63
Location of the firm's offices where work will be accomplished.	3	3	0
State Certified MBE (2 points for state certified MBE primes and/or subconsultants)	2	2	0
EBO Program Evaluation preference as applied by the GSC. APIs for this contract are: SBE Evaluation Preference. Ordinance Reference: 2-80.27(3)(d)(option 1).	15	15	0
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past 4 years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	5	10
Subtotal	30	25	10
Total	100	93	73
Rank		1	2
Member's Name:	DAVID RICKS		
Member's Signature:			

SELECTION EVALUATION FORM



ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE:	All Engineering Services Required for:
	Street Lighting System Design and Related Inspection (CEI) Professional Continuing Services Contract on a Consultant Service Authorization Basis
PROJECT NO:	2023051
SELECTION MEETING DATE:	Thursday, August 10, 2023
SELECTION MEETING TIME:	10:30 A.M.


Criteria	Max Score	HBC Engineering Company	REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineers
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the requirements of the project.	35	32	30
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of written response, including meeting schedule requirements.	35	32	30
<i>Subtotal</i>	70	64	60
Location of the firm's offices where work will be accomplished.	3	3	0
State Certified MBE (2 points for state certified MBE primes and/or subconsultants)	2	2	0
EBO Program Evaluation preference as applied by the GSC. APIs for this contract are: SBE Evaluation Preference. Ordinance Reference: 2-80.27(3)(d)(option 1).	15	15	0
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past 4 years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	5	10
<i>Subtotal</i>	30	25	10
Total	100	89	70
Rank		1	2

Member's Name:	Henry Melendez
Member's Signature:	; 8/10/23


SELECTION EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE:	All Engineering Services Required for:		
	Street Lighting System Design and Related Inspection (CEI) Professional Continuing Services Contract on a Consultant Service Authorization Basis		
PROJECT NO:	2023051		
SELECTION MEETING DATE:	Thursday, August 10, 2023		
SELECTION MEETING TIME:	10:30 A.M.		
Criteria	Max Score	HBC Engineering Company	REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineers
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the requirements of the project.	35	35	35
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of written response, including meeting schedule requirements.	35	35	30
Subtotal	70	70	65
Location of the firm's offices where work will be accomplished.	3	3	0
State Certified MBE (2 points for state certified MBE primes and/or subconsultants)	2	2	0
EBO Program Evaluation preference as applied by the GSC. APIs for this contract are: SBE Evaluation Preference. Ordinance Reference: 2-80.27(3)(d)(option 1).	15	15	0
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past 4 years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	5	10
Subtotal	30	25	10
Total	100	95	75
	Rank	1	2
Member's Name:	Irwin F. Jacobowitz		
Member's Signature:	Fanny M. Arini for Irwin F. Jacobowitz		


SELECTION EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE:	All Engineering Services Required for:		
	Street Lighting System Design and Related Inspection (CEI) Professional Continuing Services Contract on a Consultant Service Authorization Basis		
PROJECT NO:	2023051		
SELECTION MEETING DATE:	Thursday, August 10, 2023		
SELECTION MEETING TIME:	10:30 A.M.		
Criteria	Max Score	HBC Engineering Company	REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineers
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the requirements of the project.	35	35	35
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of written response, including meeting schedule requirements.	35	35	35
Subtotal	70		
Location of the firm's offices where work will be accomplished.	3	3	0
State Certified MBE (2 points for state certified MBE primes and/or subconsultants)	2	2	0
EBO Program Evaluation preference as applied by the GSC. APIs for this contract are: SBE Evaluation Preference. Ordinance Reference: 2-80.27(3)(d)(option 1).	15	15	0
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past 4 years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	5	10
Subtotal	30	25	10
Total	100	95	80 max
	Rank	1	2
Member's Name:	Motasem Al-Turk		
Member's Signature:			

SELECTION EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE:	All Engineering Services Required for:		
	Street Lighting System Design and Related Inspection (CEI) Professional Continuing Services Contract on a Consultant Service Authorization Basis		
PROJECT NO:	2023051		
SELECTION MEETING DATE:	Thursday, August 10, 2023		
SELECTION MEETING TIME:	10:30 A.M.		
Criteria	Max Score	HBC Engineering Company	REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineers
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the requirements of the project.	35	32	34
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of written response, including meeting schedule requirements.	35	32	32
Subtotal	70		
Location of the firm's offices where work will be accomplished.	3	3	0
State Certified MBE (2 points for state certified MBE primes and/or subconsultants)	2	2	0
EBO Program Evaluation preference as applied by the GSC. APIs for this contract are: SBE Evaluation Preference. Ordinance Reference: 2-80.27(3)(d)(option 1).	15	15	0
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past 4 years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	5	10
Subtotal	30	25	10
Total	100	89	76
	Rank	1	2
Member's Name:	Allen Gray		
Member's Signature:			

SELECTION EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE:	All Engineering Services Required for:		
	Street Lighting System Design and Related Inspection (CEI) Professional Continuing Services Contract on a Consultant Service Authorization Basis		
PROJECT NO:	2023051		
SELECTION MEETING DATE:	Thursday, August 10, 2023		
SELECTION MEETING TIME:	10:30 A.M.		
Criteria	Max Score	HBC Engineering Company	REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineers
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the requirements of the project.	35	35	35
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of written response, including meeting schedule requirements.	35	30	30
Subtotal	70		
Location of the firm's offices where work will be accomplished.	3	3	0
State Certified MBE (2 points for state certified MBE primes and/or subconsultants)	2	2	0
EBO Program Evaluation preference as applied by the GSC. APIs for this contract are: SBE Evaluation Preference. Ordinance Reference: 2-80.27(3)(d)(option 1).	15	15	0
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past 4 years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	5	10
Subtotal	30	25	10
Total	100	90	75
	Rank	1	2
Member's Name:	Kattoush Jabar		
Member's Signature:			

SELECTION CONSULTANT SUMMARY

One Firm to Provide: Professional Engineering Consulting Services for
Street Lighting System Design and Related Inspection (CEI) Professional Continuing Services Contract
on a Consultant Service Authorization Basis

Project No: 2023051
EBO API's: SBE Evaluation Preference. *Ord. Ref.: 2-80.27(3)(d)(Option 1)*

Meeting Date: Thursday, August 10, 2023
Meeting Time: 10:30 A.M.

TEAM				LOCATION		EBO			VOLUME OF PREVIOUS WORK (\$)			
Team Members	Services Provided	% Work on Project	Notes	% Work in PBC	Points (3 max)	SBE	PBC M/WBE	FL M/WBE	Points (17 max)	Fee Considered	Pro-Rated Fee*	Points (10 max)
<u>HBC Engineering Company</u>	9.05	100%	10	100%	<u>3</u>	100.0	100.0	100.0	<u>17</u>	\$733,874	\$733,874	<u>5</u>
		100%		100%		100.0%	100.0%	100.0%			\$733,874	
						15		2				
<u>REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineers</u>	9.05	100%	7	0%	<u>0</u>				<u>0</u>	\$0	\$0	<u>10</u>
* - REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineers does not have a local office. No Business Tax Receipt for the Palm Beach County Tax Collector.		100%		0%		0.0%	0.0%	0.0%			\$0	
						0		0				

Prime Categories	Subcategories	Notes
9.05 (Highway Lighting)		* - Pro Rated Fee = Previous Work Amount multiplied by the % of work on the project 1 - Prime and Sub on different teams 2 - Unrequested Service 3 - Incomplete Team 4 - Did not meet mandatory EBO requirement 5 - Prime is doing less than 50% of the work 6 - Prime does not have at least one prime category 7 - Errors or Blanks on Questionnaires or Forms Missing 8 - Not registered in VSS 9 - SF 330 Missing or Incomplete 10 - Blanks or "TBD" on Summary Chart at End of Letter 11 - Not CCNA Certified in a category they propose to provide

OEBO PARTICIPATION EVALUATION FORM

DATE SENT: December 16, 2022	CONTRACTS MANAGER:
PROJECT #: 2023051	PROJECT NAME: Street Lighting Design and Related Inspections
USER DEPARTMENT: Engineering	SOLICITATION OPENING DATE:
OEBO ESTABLISHED API: SBE Evaluation Preference. [Ordinance Ref: 2-80.27 (3) (d) Option 1	

KEYS FOR DETERMINATIONS:

- (1) YES
- (2) NO
- (3) N/A

PROPOSAL EVALUATION INFORMATION

PRIME RESPONDENT	PRIME IS A CERTIFIED S/M/WBE	PRIME RESPONDENT IS ELIGIBLE FOR POINTS	PERCENTAGE OF S/M/WBE UTILIZATION	EVALUATION POINTS
E. C. Fennell Engineering Consultants	(2)	(2)	0%	0
HBC Engineering Company	(1)	(1)	100%	15
REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineers	(2)	(2)	0%	0

EVALUATION NOTES: See evaluation notes on the attached compliance review page.

EVALUATED BY: Angela Smith, Small Business Development Specialist III

SIGNATURE: 

DATE: 12/16/2022

REVIEWED BY: Allen Gray, Manager

SIGNATURE: 

DATE: 12/16/2022

	Certification Status	Expiration Date	Percentage of Work	
Prime Respondent: E. C. Fennell Engineering Consultants	<i>Non-SBE</i>	N/A	100%	
Sub-Consultant Name				Points
NONE	<i>N/A</i>	N/A	N/A	<input type="checkbox"/>
TOTAL SBE PARTICIPATION			0%	
EVALUATION POINTS			0	

Evaluation Comments:

E. C. Fennell Engineering Consultants is not eligible to receive SBE Evaluation Points.

	Certification Status	Expiration Date	Percentage of Work	
Prime Respondent: HBC Engineering Company	<i>MBE - AA</i>	5/23/2025	100%	
Sub-Consultant Name				POINTS
Prime S/MBE Respondent Self-performing	<i>MBE-AA</i>	5/23/2025	100%	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
TOTAL SBE PARTICIPATION			100%	
EVALUATION POINTS			15	

Evaluation Comments:

HBC Engineering Company is eligible to receive SBE Evaluation Points and they are responsive to the EBO requirements.

	Certification Status	Expiration Date	Percentage of Work	
Prime Respondent: REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineers	<i>Non-SBE</i>	N/A	100%	
Sub-Consultant Name				POINTS
NONE	N/A	N/A	N/A	<input type="checkbox"/>
TOTAL SBE PARTICIPATION			0%	
EVALUATION POINTS			0	

Evaluation Comments:

REDD, Inc. (dba) Town Lighting Engineers are not eligible to receive SBE Evaluation Points.

SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING

Palm Beach County Engineering Department

One (1) Firm - to provide all engineering services required for:

**Street Lighting System Design and Related Inspection (CEI) Professional Continuing Services Contract
on a Consultant Service Authorization Basis
Project No. 2023051**

Thursday, August 10, 2023

Name	Organization	Phone	Email
JAEANN DEAN	ENG. / RDWY	561-684-4154	jadean@pbgov.org
Holly Knight	Eng - Roadway	561-684-4150	hknight@pbgov.org
Fanny M. Amiri	OfmB	561-355-3352	famiri@pbgov.org
Allen Gray	DEAD	561-616-6842	Agray@pbgov.org
Henry Melendez	WUD/Eng	561 493-0120	hmelendez@pbwater.com
Fatoush Jahar	Eng - Traffic	561-684-4030	FJAFAR@PBCCGOV.ORG
May Cheng	Eng Traffic	561 684-4030	mcheng@pbgov.org
DAVID RICKS	ENG	355-2006	DRICKS@PBCCGOV.ORG
Motamen Al-Turk	Eng. / Traff.	684-4030	