Rob Beitler

From:

Maryann.Volturara@hklaw.com

sent:

Thursday, July 12, 2012 4:37 PM

To:

Rob Beitler

Cc:

martin.alexander@hklaw.com; nathan.adams@hklaw.com; Eric.Kent@hklaw.com;

Maryann.Volturara@hklaw.com

Subject:

BOCK I IG Matter

Attachments:

BOCK _ IG Matter - Sharon Bock _s Response to IG _s Motion to Intervene.PDF

Mr. Beitler,

Attached is Sharon R. Bock's Response to the Inspector General's Motion to Intervene. We apologize for having failed to serve this on you.

We have updated our service list to include you.

Thank you, Maryann

Maryann Volturara | Holland & Knight

Sr Legal Assistant

222 Lakeview Avenue, Suite 1000 | West Palm Beach FL 33401

Phone 561.650.8396 | Fax 561.650.8399

maryann.volturara@hklaw.com | www.hklaw.com

dd to address book

**** IRS CIRCULAR 230 DISCLOSURE: TO ENSURE COMPLIANCE WITH REQUIREMENTS IMPOSED BY THE IRS, WE INFORM YOU THAT ANY TAX ADVICE CONTAINED IN THIS COMMUNICATION (INCLUDING ANY ATTACHMENTS) IS NOT INTENDED OR WRITTEN BY HOLLAND & KNIGHT LLP TO BE USED, AND CANNOT BE USED, FOR THE PURPOSE OF (I) AVOIDING TAX-RELATED PENALTIES UNDER THE INTERNAL REVENUE CODE, OR (II) PROMOTING, MARKETING, OR RECOMMENDING TO ANOTHER PARTY ANY TAX-RELATED MATTER HEREIN.****

NOTE: This e-mail is from a law firm, Holland & Knight LLP ("H&K"), and is intended solely for the use of the individual(s) to whom it is addressed. If you believe you received this e-mail in error, please notify the sender immediately, delete the e-mail from your computer and do not copy or disclose it to anyone else. If you are not an existing client of H&K, do not construe anything in this e-mail to make you a client unless it contains a specific statement to that effect and do not disclose anything to H&K in reply that you expect it to hold in confidence. If you properly received this e-mail as a client, co-counsel or retained expert of H&K, you should maintain its contents in confidence in order to preserve the attorney-client or work product privilege that may be available to protect confidentiality.

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF THE FIFTEENTH JUDICIAL CIRCUIT IN AND FOR PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA CASE NO.: 50 2011 CA 017953 AN

TOWN OF GULF STREAM, VILLAGE OF TEQUESTA, CITY OF RIVIERA BEACH, TOWN OF JUPITER, CITY OF DELRAY BEACH, TOWN OF PALM BEACH SHORES, TOWN OF MANALAPAN, VILLAGE OF WELLINGTON TOWN OF MANGONIA PARK, CITY OF PALM BEACH GARDENS, TOWN OF HIGHLAND BEACH, TOWN OF LAKE PARK, CITY OF WEST PALM BEACH, TOWN OF OCEAN RIDGE, CITY OF BOCA RATON, municipal Corporations of the State of Florida,

Plaintiffs,

VS.

PALM BEACH COUNTY, a political subdivision,

Defendant.

SHARON R. BOCK, in her Official Capacity as the Clerk & Comptroller of Palm Beach County, Florida

Intervenor.

RESPONSE TO INSPECTOR GENERAL'S MOTION TO INTERVENE

Sharon R. Bock, in her official capacity as Clerk & Comptroller of Palm Beach County (the "Clerk and Comptroller"), by and through her undersigned counsel, and in accordance with Rule 1.230, Florida Rules of Civil Procedure, files this Response to the Inspector General's Motion to Intervene, incorporating the arguments of the County and Municipalities, and states:

Introduction

The Clerk & Comptroller is an intervenor in this action by Agreed Order with standing to participate as an elected constitutional officer under Article V, section 16 and Article VIII,

section 1(d) of the Florida Constitution, required by statute and common law to serve as the custodian, keeper, accountant, auditor, inspector and examiner of all County accounts including those funds deposited in the Office of Inspector General, Palm Beach County, Florida Special Revenue Fund (the "IG Account"). See §§ 28.12, 129.09, 136.08, Fla. Stat. The Clerk & Comptroller is required to attest to every check or warrant drawn on County accounts including the IG Account and may be liable for willfully and knowingly signing a warrant for a charge not authorized by law. §§ 129.09, 136.06, Fla. Stat.

The Clerk & Comptroller takes no position on the merits of this litigation. She solicits declaratory relief as to whether her compliance with the financial support and budgeting requirements set forth in Article XII, § 2-429, County Code, is consistent with her constitutional, statutory and other duties. The Clerk & Comptroller has accepted this lawsuit as she found it and raised only those issues incident to the underlying claims and counterclaim of the parties. The parties hoped to resolve this dispute, but now that they are forging ahead with the litigation the Clerk & Comptroller is working diligently with the County to determine how to handle funds with the approval of this Court received from municipalities not party to this lawsuit.¹

ARGUMENT

In November 2010, the electors of Palm Beach County established the Office of Inspector General by Charter amendment and later by County Ordinance. Charter § 8.3; Ord. No. 2009-049, as amended by 2011-009 ("Ordinance"). It is an office respected by the Clerk & Comptroller and the parties to this litigation; however, the Charter, Ordinance and common law are clear that the IG lacks standing to intervene in this case. Charter, § 4.3 ("The office of county

¹ These funds constitute a fraction of the IG's budget and of the sums owed by the Plaintiffs if the Ordinance is constitutional. Meanwhile, the Inspector General has more than sufficient funds to operate her department in the ordinary course for several months to come.

attorney shall prosecute and defend all civil actions for and on behalf of Palm Beach County and the Board of County Commissioners...."); Art. XII, § 2-429(7), County Code ("In the event payment is not timely received [on an invoice for financial support of the IG], the county or any municipality in compliance with this section may pursue any available legal remedy."); North Miami Bch. Water Bd. v. Gollin, 171 So. 2d 584, 585-86 (Fla. 3d DCA 1965) (where city was authorized to create, by ordinance, a separate department to manage, control and operate water department, and water board was to be appointed by city council, water board was a subservient department within municipality and had no standing to become a party defendant in proceedings brought against city; denying North Miami Beach Water Board's motion to intervene for lack of standing); Florida City Police Dep't v. Corcoran, 661 So. 2d 409 (Fla. 3d DCA 1995) (police department was not an entity subject to suit).

The electors of Palm Beach County and the County itself conferred upon the IG limited powers excluding the right to defend this action. Charter § 4.3. The Charter is the constitution of Palm Beach County. This Court's main purpose is to construe the constitution in such a manner as to ascertain the intent of the framers and to effectuate that object. *Metro-Dade Fire Rescue Serv. Dist v. Metro-Dade Cnty.*, 616 So. 2d 966, 968 (Fla. 1993). The implementing ordinance for the IG may not contradict the charter. *Id.* at 970. In this case, all speak in unison: the Charter confers on the County Attorney the authority to defend civil actions while granting the Inspector General ("IG") no such legal authority, Charter §§ 4.3, 8.3; and the Ordinance explicitly states the County shall pursue any legal remedy in the event the IG is not funded. Art. XII, § 2-429(7), County Code. Other than the Charter, there is no other constitutional or

² The electors of Palm Beach County knew how to authorize the Inspector General to pursue legal remedies, but decided against it. See Art. XII, s. 2-423(3), County Code (authorizing the Inspector General to make application to any circuit court of the state which shall have jurisdiction to order a witness to appear before the Inspector General and to produce evidence in the case of a refusal to obey a subpoena).

statutory authority upon which this Court may rely to grant the IG's motion to intervene.³ Consequently, the IG lacks substantive capacity or standing to exercise any procedural right to intervene. *Gollin*, 171 So. 2d at 585-86; Rule 1.230, Fla. R. Civ. P.

In addition, the IG is not entitled to the special treatment she seeks incompatible with traditional intervenor status. Intervenors ordinarily cannot do what the IG demands: to dismiss pleadings (contrary to the County's legal posture), to dismiss Plaintiffs, to dismiss the Clerk & Comptroller, and to raise new albeit erroneous legal issues tertiary to the underlying dispute. See Fla. Gas. Co. v. Am. Emp'rs' Ins. Co., 218 So. 2d 197 (Fla. 3d DCA 1969) (affirming denial of intervenor's motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim on grounds intervenor was bound by record at time of intervention); Krouse v. Palmer, 131 Fla. 444, 179 So. 762, 763 (1938) (affirming interpretation of motion to dismiss by intervenors as the equivalent of a motion to dismiss interveners as parties defendants). The IG erroneously raises as new issues tertiary questions including the Clerk & Comptroller's constitutional and statutory standing, as well as the Clerk & Comptroller's exercise of her statutory responsibilities. "A trial court does not abuse its discretion when it denies intervention because the would-be intervenor seeks to inject new issues into the pending action." Allstate Ins. Co. v. Johnson, 483 So. 2d 524, 525 (Fla. 5th DCA

³ The authority to establish a municipality or quasi-municipal entity such as an independent special district is exclusively the Legislature's. *Bd. of Comm'rs of Jupiter Inlet Dist. v. Thibadeau*, 956 So. 2d 529, 532 (Fla. 4th DCA 2007). The County may establish a dependent special district, Ch. 189, Fla. Stat., but the electors of Palm Beach County did not choose to establish the IG in this fashion.

⁴ A comptroller may challenge a law that requires the expenditure of public funds as it is the comptroller's duty to collect, control and disburse them. See, e.g., Green v. City of Pensacola, 108 So. 2d 897, 900-01 (Fla. 1st DCA 1959) (comptroller entitled to question constitutionality of special act which purports to exempt the City of Pensacola from payment of gross receipts tax as required by general law); accord Kaulakis v. Boyd, 138 So. 2d 505 (Fla. 1962) (county commissioners had the right and duty to challenge the validity of a portion of their home rule charter, which purported to make the county liable in tort to the same extent as municipalities since a judgment for the plaintiff would have required the commissioners to expend public funds in satisfaction thereof). Public officials also have standing to challenge a law that will injure them. Green, 108 So. 2d at 900.

1986).⁵ Consequently, and for the reasons discussed in the County's and City's responses, this Court should deny the IG's Motion to Intervene.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this the 28th day of June 2012, a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been furnished by email and U. S. Mail to counsel as follows:

Claudia M. McKenna, Esq.	John C. Randolph, Esq.
City Attorney	Jones, Foster, Johnson & Stubbs, P.A.
Douglas N. Yeargin, Esq.	Flagler Center Tower
Assistant City Attorney	505 S. Flagler Drive, Suite 1100
Kimberly L. Rothenburg, Esq.	West Palm Beach, FL 33401
Assistant City Attorney	Fax (561) 832-1454
City of West Palm Beach	Counsel for Town of Gulf Stream
401 Clematis Street	irandolph@iones-foster.com
West Palm Beach, FL 33401-5319	-
Fax: (561) 822-1373	
Counsel for City of West Palm Beach	
cmckenna@wpb.org	
dyeargin@wpb.org	
krothen burg@wpb.org	·
Keith W. Davis, Esq.	Pamala Hanna Ryan, Esq.
Corbett and White, P.A.	City of Riviera Beach Attorney's Office
1111 Hypoluxo Road, Suite 207	600 W. Blue Heron Blvd.
Lantana, FL 33462-4271	Riviera Beach, FL 33404-4017
Fax (561) 586-9611	Fax (561) 845-4017
Counsel for Village of Tequesta,	Counsel for City of Riviera Beach
Town of Palm Beach Shores, and	pryan@rivierabch.com
Town of Mangonia Park	
keith@corbettandwhite.com	

⁵ Assuming *arguendo* the IG had any standing to intervene, it would be lesser by virtue of the IG's dependence on Charter and Ordinance than the standing of a constitutional and statutory officer's; nevertheless, the IG aims for greater standing for the purpose, *inter alia*, of overturning the constitutional officer's. The incongruity of the IG's position is self-evident.

Thomas J. Baird, Esq.	R. Brian Shutt, Esq.
Jones, Foster, Johnson & Stubbs, P.A.	City Attorney
801 Maplewood Drive, Suite 22A	City of Delray Beach
Jupiter, FL 33458-8821	200 NW 1 st Avenue
Fax (561) 746-6933	Delray Beach, FL 33444-2768
Counsel for Town of Jupiter and	(561) 278-4755
Town of Lake Park	Counsel for City of Delray Beach
tbaird@jones-foster.com	shutt@MyDelrayBeach.com
tband(w)ones-roster.com	pyburn@MyDelrayBeach.com
Trale I White Eas	
Trela J. White, Esq.	Jeffrey S. Kurtz, Esq. The Law Offices of Glen J. Torcivia and
Corbett and White, P.A.	
1111 Hypoluxo Road, Suite 207	Associates
Lantana, FL 33462-4271	701 Northpoint Parkway, Suite 209
Fax (561) 586-9611	West Palm Beach, FL 33407-1956
Counsel for Town of Manalapan	Fax (561) 686-8764
trela@corbettandwhite.com	Counsel for Village of Wellington
R. Max Lohman, Esq.	Thomas Edward Sliney, Esq.
Corbett and White, P.A.	Buckingham, Doolittle & Burroughs, LLP
1111 Hypoluxo Road, Suite 207	5355 Town Center Road, Suite 900
Lantana, FL 33462-4271	Boca Raton, FL 33486-1069
Fax (561) 586-9611	Fax (561) 241-9766
Counsel for City of Palm Beach Gardens	Counsel for Town of Highland Beach
max@corbettandwhite.com	tsliney@bdblaw.com
Kenneth G. Spillias, Esq.	Diana Grub Frieser, Esq.
Lewis Longman & Walker	City Attorney
515 N. Flagler Drive, Suite 1500	City of Boca Raton
West Palm Beach, FL 33401-4327	201 W. Palmetto Park Road
Fax (561) 640-8202	Boca Raton, FL 33432-3730
Counsel for Town of Ocean Ridge	Fax (561) 393-7780
kspillias@llw-law.com	Counsel for City of Boca Raton
	dgrioli@myboca.us
Andrew J. McMahon, Esq.	
Chief Assistant County Attorney	
Philip Mugavero, Esq.	
Post Office Box 1989	
West Palm Beach, FL 33402	
· ·	
91 0 0	
Philip Mugavero, Esq. Assistant County Attorney Post Office Box 1989	

Martin J. Alexander Florida Bar No. 346845

HOLLAND & KNIGHT LIP

222 Lakeview Avenue, Suite 1000

West Palm Beach, Florida 33401

Tel: (561) 833-2000 Fax: (561) 650-8399

and

Nathan A. Adams, IV

Florida Bar No. 090492

HOLLAND & KNIGHT LLP

Post Office Drawer 810

Tallahassee, Florida 32302

Tel: (850) 224-7000

Fax: (850) 222-8185

Counsel for Intervenor