Agenda Item #: 4D

PALM BEACH COUNTY BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS AGENDA ITEM SUMMARY

Meeting Date: May 17, 2011 [] Consent
--

[X] Public Hearing

Department

Submitted By: COUNTY ATTORNEY

Submitted For: COMMISSION ON ETHICS

I. EXECUTIVE BRIEF

Motion and Title: Staff recommends motion to adopt: an ordinance of the Board of County Commissioners of Palm Beach County, Florida, repealing the Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics Ordinance, Ordinance 2009-050, as amended, and adopting a new countywide Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics Ordinance; providing for creation and jurisdiction; providing for membership qualifications, terms and vacancy; providing for applicability of the code of ethics; providing for organization of the Commission on Ethics; providing for powers and duties; providing for extended jurisdiction by interagency agreements; providing for financial support; providing for procedure on complaints filed; providing for public hearing procedures; providing for notification and referral to other authorities; providing for dismissal of complaints; providing for frivolous or groundless complaints; providing for effect on other laws; providing for prospective jurisdiction; providing for personnel proceeding; providing for statute of limitations; providing for advisory opinion; providing for appeals; providing for savings clause; providing for repeal of laws in conflict; providing for severability; providing for inclusion in the code of laws and ordinances; and providing for an effective date.

Summary: The Board of County Commissioners adopted an ordinance creating the Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics as part of a series of ethics reforms begun in December 2009. Since then, the Board proposed charter amendments requiring in part the adoption of an ordinance extending the jurisdiction of the Commission on Ethics to the municipalities in Palm Beach County. The charter amendments, which were approved by the voters in November 2010, also called for the establishment of a drafting committee to propose recommended changes to the existing Commission on Ethics Ordinance for countywide application. This ordinance is the product of the committee's work. A brief description of substantive changes to this ordinance is included as Attachment 3. Countywide (LB)

(Continued on page 3)

Attachments:
1. Ordinance
2. Strike-through/underline version for pomparison
3. Brief description of substantive changes
Recommended by: 05/09/2011
Alan Johnson, Executive Director Date
Approved by:N/A

II. FISCAL IMPACT ANALYSIS

A.	Five Year Summary of Fiscal Impact:						
	Fiscal Years	2011	2012	201	3	2014	2015
-	al Expenditures ating Costs	475,626			-		
Progr	nal Revenues ram Income (County) nd Match (County)				 		
NE	T FISCAL IMPACT	475,626		<u></u>	_		
	DDITIONAL FTE SITIONS (Cumulative	e)			_		
Is Iter	m Included in Curren	t Budget?		Yes_X_	No		
Budge	et Account No.:	Fund 1484	Departi	ment <u>29</u> 0	Unit_2	OO Object	Various
		Reporting C	ategory_				
B.	Recommended Sou	urces of Fund	ls/Sumn	nary of Fisc	al Impac	t:	
C.	Departmental Fisca	al Review:					
		III. <u>REV</u>	IEW CO	MMENTS			
A. B.	OFMB Fiscal and/o	r Contract De			1.	restry 3	5)1 3 1 1/ ntrol
	Assistant Count	ty Attorney					
C.	Other Department F						
	Department	しょうにこ					

THIS SUMMARY IS NOT TO BE USED AS A BASIS FOR PAYMENT.

(Continued from page 1)

Background and Policy Issues: The Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics will be empowered to review, interpret, render advisory opinions and enforce the Palm Beach County Code of Ethics, countywide. The Commission on Ethics will also provide training and outreach programs for county and municipal employees and officials, county and municipal vendors, and other entities that do business with the County and municipalities. Other local governmental agencies will be able to employ the services of and be subject to the Commission on Ethics by contract. To ensure independence, Commission on Ethics members have been appointed by one university president and four collegial bodies, not one of which is subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission on Ethics. The board is composed of a former law enforcement official with experience investigating white collar crime or public corruption, an attorney with experience in ethics regulation, an ethics educator, a certified public accountant, and a former elected official. The Commission on Ethics, along with one representative each from the State Attorney and Public Defender, make up the Inspector General Committee. The Inspector General Committee selects the Inspector General, decides whether or not to renew the term of office for the Inspector General, receives and reviews annual reports from the Inspector General, and may initiate and participate in proceedings to remove the Inspector General.

ORDINANCE NO. 2011-____

4 5 6

17

22232425

26 27 28

293031

32 33

34

35

36

37

39

38

41

40

43

44

42

45

46

AN**ORDINANCE OF** THE BOARD **OF** COUNTY COMMISSIONERS OF PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, REPEALING THE PALM BEACH COUNTY COMMISSION ON ETHICS ORDINANCE, ORDINANCE 2009-050, AS AMENDED, AND ADOPTING A NEW COUNTYWIDE PALM BEACH COUNTY COMMISSION ON ETHICS ORDINANCE; PROVIDING FOR CREATION JURISDICTION; AND MEMBERSHIP QUALIFICATIONS, TERMS AND VACANCY; PROVIDING FOR APPLICABILITY OF THE CODE OF ETHICS; PROVIDING FOR ORGANIZATION OF THE COMMISSION ON ETHICS; PROVIDING FOR POWERS AND DUTIES; PROVIDING **FOR EXTENDED JURISDICTION** BY **INTERAGENCY** AGREEMENTS; PROVIDING FOR FINANCIAL SUPPORT; PROVIDING FOR PROCEDURE ON COMPLAINTS FILED; **PROVIDING PUBLIC HEARING** FOR **PROCEDURES**; PROVIDING FOR NOTIFICATION AND REFERRAL TO OTHER **AUTHORITIES**; PROVIDING FOR DISMISSAL **OF** COMPLAINTS; **PROVIDING FOR FRIVOLOUS** OR GROUNDLESS COMPLAINTS; PROVIDING FOR EFFECT ON **OTHER PROSPECTIVE** LAWS; **PROVIDING FOR** JURISDICTION; PROVIDING FOR PERSONNEL PROCEEDING; PROVIDING FOR STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS; PROVIDING FOR ADVISORY OPINION; PROVIDING FOR APPEALS; PROVIDING FOR SAVINGS CLAUSE; PROVIDING FOR REPEAL OF LAWS IN CONFLICT; PROVIDING FOR SEVERABILITY; PROVIDING FOR INCLUSION IN THE CODE OF LAWS AND ORDINANCES; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

WHEREAS, based on a referendum on November 2, 2010, concerning proposed amendments to the Palm Beach County Charter, a majority of voters in the County and in every municipality in Palm Beach County elected to require the Board of County Commissioners to adopt an ordinance to establish a countywide Commission on Ethics with the authority to review, interpret, render advisory opinions and to enforce the countywide Palm Beach County Code of Ethics and to provide ethics training for the benefit of local governments, citizens groups and the general public; and

WHEREAS, the Palm Beach County Board of County Commissioners finds that the integrity of the governmental decision-making process is essential to the continued functioning of an open government; and

WHEREAS, the Board of County Commissioners further finds that the establishment of the countywide Commission on Ethics will ensure the integrity of these processes and restore public confidence in government; and

WHEREAS, the purpose of the Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics is to serve as the guardian of the public trust by, among other things, educating elected and appointed officials and other public servants and those who do business with local governments as to the required standards of ethical conduct and enforcing those standards of conduct; and

WHEREAS, it is not the intent of the Board of County Commissioners that the Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics serve as a personnel board resolving personnel matters involving County and municipal employees; and

WHEREAS, the Board of County Commissioners hereby determines that the Ordinance set forth herein advances the purposes and intent of the Palm Beach County Charter amendments approved by the electorate on November 2, 2010; and

WHEREAS, the Board of County Commissioners of Palm Beach County, pursuant to its authority under Florida Constitution, Article VIII, Section 1(g), Section 125.01, Florida Statutes, the Palm Beach County Charter, hereby adopts the Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics Ordinance; and

WHEREAS, the Board of County Commissioners has conducted a duly noticed public hearing to consider these amendments as required by law.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT ORDAINED BY THE BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS OF PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, that:

SECTION 1. THE PALM BEACH COUNTY COMMISSION ON ETHICS.

The Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics, Ordinance 2009-050, is hereby repealed and the new countywide Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics Ordinance is hereby adopted as set forth in Exhibit 1 which is attached hereto and made a part hereof.

SECTION 2. SAVINGS CLAUSE.

All complaints, investigations, advisory opinions, recommended orders, final orders, requests for advisory opinions, hearing processes, and all other functions of the Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics, initiated or completed pursuant to Ordinance 2009-050 or Ordinance 2009-051, as amended, shall remain in full force and effect. The membership and terms of each member of the Commission on Ethics shall remain as originally established pursuant to Ordinance 2009-050.

SECTION 3. REPEAL OF LAWS IN CONFLICT.

All local laws and ordinances in conflict with any provisions of this Ordinance are hereby repealed to the extent of such conflict.

1	SECTION 4. SEVERABILITY.						
2	If any section, paragraph, sentence, clause, phrase, or word of this Ordinance is for any						
3	reason held by the Court to be unconstitutional, inoperative, or void, such holding shall not affect the						
4	remainder of this Ordinance.						
5	SECTION 5. INCLUSION IN THE CODE OF LAWS AND ORDINANCES.						
6	The provisions of this Ordinance shall become and be made a part of the Code of Laws and						
7	Ordinances of Palm Beach County, Florida. The sections of this Ordinance may be renumbered o						
8	re-lettered to accomplish such, and the word "ordinance" may be changed to "section," "article," o						
9	other appropriate word.						
10	PART 6. EFFECTIVE DATE.						
11	The provisions of this Ordinance shall become effective upon filing with the State of Florid						
12	Department of State.						
13	APPROVED AND ADOPTED by the Board of County Commissioners of Palm Beach						
14	County, Florida, on this the day of May, 2011.						
15 16 17 18	SHARON R. BOCK CLERK & COMPTROLLER PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, BY ITS BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS						
19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35 36 37	By: By: Karen T. Marcus, Chair (SEAL) APPROVED AS TO FORM AND LEGAL SUFFICIENCY By: County Attorney						
38	Filed with the Department of State on the day of, 20						

1 Sec. 2-254. Creation and jurisdiction.

2 The Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics (hereinafter "commission on ethics") is hereby 3 established. The jurisdiction of the commission on ethics shall extend to any person required to 4 comply with the countywide code of ethics, the county lobbyist registration ordinance, and the county post-employment ordinance, and may further extend to persons or entities required to 5 comply with additional ordinances and regulations duly adopted by other county, local, or 6 municipal government and any commission, bureau, district, or other governmental entity 8 located in Palm Beach County as more fully set forth below. The jurisdiction of the commission on ethics is not exclusive. Any person or entity subject to a complaint to the county's 9 commission on ethics may also be subject to a separate complaint to the state commission on 10 ethics or pursuant to a municipality's ethics ordinance. A finding by the county's commission on 11 ethics is not binding on the state and may not be binding on the municipality, depending on the 12 nature of the complaint and whether the municipality's ethics ordinance is more restrictive than 13 14 the countywide ethics code.

15 16

17

18

Sec. 2-255. Membership, qualifications, terms, vacancies.

- (a) Composition and appointment. The commission on ethics shall be composed of five (5) members. The members of the commission on ethics shall be appointed as follows:
- 19 (1) The president of the county association of chiefs of police shall be requested to appoint a 20 former law enforcement official with experience in investigating white collar crime or public 21 corruption.
- 22 (2) The president of the Hispanic Bar Association of Palm Beach County, the president of the F.
 23 Malcolm Cunningham, Sr. Bar Association, and the president of the county bar association shall
 24 be requested to appoint an attorney with experience in ethics regulation of public officials and
 25 employees.
- 26 (3) The president of Florida Atlantic University (FAU) shall be requested to appoint a faculty
 27 member who teaches at an institution of higher education with a campus located in the county
 28 and who has taught a course in professional legal ethics or has published or performed services
 29 in the field of professional legal ethics.
- 30 (4) The president of the Palm Beach Chapter of the Florida Institute of CPAs shall be requested 31 to appoint a member who possesses at least five (5) years experience as a certified public 32 accountant (CPA) with forensic audit experience.
- 33 (5) The board of directors of the Palm Beach County League of Cities, Inc. shall be requested to 34 appoint a person who has served as a former elected official for a governmental entity in the 35 county.
- All appointing officers or entities identified in subsections (a)(1) through (5) shall in good faith endeavor to appoint members of the commission on ethics within forty-five (45) days of the effective date of the ordinance from which this division is derived. Each appointing entity shall promptly provide notice of each appointment to the county administrator.
- 40 (b) Additional qualifications. Each member of the commission on ethics shall be of outstanding reputation for integrity, responsibility and commitment to serving the community. The members of the commission on ethics should be representative of the community-at-large and should reflect the racial, gender and ethnic make-up of the community. Before entering upon the duties of office, each appointee on the commission on ethics shall take the prescribed oath of office pursuant to Florida Constitution, Art. II §5(b). Members of the commission on ethics shall serve without compensation.

- (c) Term. The members of the commission on ethics shall serve staggered terms of four (4) years each, provided that of the original members, two (2) members described in subsections (a)(1) and (2) shall be appointed for an initial term of two (2) years. The remaining three (3) members shall be appointed for an initial term of four (4) years. Thereafter, all members of the commission on ethics shall serve terms of four (4) years.
- 52 (d) Vacancies. A vacancy occurring during or at the expiration of a member's term on the commission on ethics shall be filled as provided in subsections (a) and (b), no later than sixty (60) days after the vacancy occurs.
- 55 (e) Additional requirements. No individual, while a member of the commission on ethics, 56 shall:
- 57 (1) Hold or campaign for any elective political office;
- 58 (2) Hold office in any political party or political committee;
- 59 (3) Actively participate in or contribute to any political action committee, or to any campaign 60 for state or local office or for any U.S. Congressional or Senate office serving the State of 61 Florida:
- 62 (4) Be employed by Palm Beach County, any municipality within the county, or any other governmental entity subject to the authority of the commission on ethics or the inspector general; 64 or
 - (5) Allow his or her name to be used by a campaign in support of or against any candidate for political office or any referendum or other ballot question. Nothing herein shall preclude a member of the commission on ethics from signing a petition in support of or against any referendum or other ballot question.

Sec. 2-256. Applicability of code of ethics ordinance.

The countywide code of ethics ordinance shall be applicable to all persons and/or entities within the jurisdiction of said ordinance and shall apply to the members and staff of the commission on ethics.

Sec. 2-257. Organization.

65

66

67

68 69

70

71

76

77

78 79

80

81

- (a) The commission on ethics shall elect one (1) of its voting members as chairperson who shall serve a term of two (2) years. No chairperson shall be permitted to serve two (2) consecutive terms.
- (b) The commission on ethics shall adopt bylaws and rules of procedure which are consistent with the provisions of this division and rules and regulations for the commission on ethics' governance. The commission on ethics shall hold regular meetings in accordance with the bylaws of the commission and may hold such other meetings as it deems necessary.
- (c) All meetings of the commission on ethics shall be public, and written minutes of the proceedings thereof shall be maintained by the commission on ethics. All actions taken at the meetings of the commission on ethics shall be promptly and properly recorded. Copies of all minutes, resolutions, decisions or advisory opinions of the commission on ethics shall be forwarded to the clerk to the board of county commissioners no later than thirty (30) days subsequent to any meeting of the commission on ethics.
- (d) The commission on ethics shall be empowered to appoint an executive director and to remove such appointee at will. The commission on ethics shall utilize a competitive selection process when selecting an executive director. The commission on ethics shall fix the executive director's salary, subject to ultimate budget approval by the board of county commissioners. The

93 executive director shall be empowered to appoint, remove, and suspend employees or agents of 94 the commission on ethics, subject to ultimate budget approval by the board of county commissioners. The executive director shall be further empowered to adopt personnel and management policies consistent with like policies in place for county personnel. 96

Sec. 2-258. Powers and duties.

95

98

121 122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129

130

131 132

133 134 135

- (a) The commission on ethics shall be authorized to exercise such powers and shall be required 99 to perform such duties as are hereinafter provided. The commission on ethics shall be 100 empowered to review, interpret, render advisory opinions and enforce the: 101
- 102 (1) Countywide Code of Ethics;
- (2) County Post-employment Ordinance; and 103
- 104 (3) County Lobbyist Registration Ordinance.
- 105 (b)As set forth in the Office of Inspector General, Palm Beach County, Florida Ordinance, the 106 commission on ethics shall serve with one (1) delegate each from the state attorney's office and 107 public defender's office for the Fifteenth Judicial Circuit as the inspector general committee. The 108 inspector general committee shall be authorized to select the inspector general, to determine 109 whether or not to renew the term of an inspector general, and to participate in the removal of the 110 inspector general as set forth in greater detail in the Office of Inspector General, Palm Beach
- County, Florida Ordinance. 111
- (c)The commission on ethics shall from time to time review ordinances and state and federal 112 113 laws relating to ethics in government and shall report and make recommendations to the board of
- county commissioners and municipal elected officials as it deems appropriate. 114
- 115 (d)The commission on ethics shall develop and deliver ethics training and outreach programs for 116 the benefit of county and municipal employees and officials, county and municipal vendors,
- nonprofit corporations, and other entities that do business with or are regulated by the county or 117
- the municipalities located within the county. The commission on ethics may recommend that the 118 119 board enter into agreements with other entities to provide such training and outreach programs to
- 120 be administered by the commission on ethics.

Sec. 2-258.1 Extended jurisdiction by interagency agreements.

It is anticipated that taxing districts, and other public officials and entities will recognize and desire to benefit from the services of the commission on ethics. The commission on ethics may additionally be empowered to review, interpret, render advisory opinions, and enforce similar rules or regulations duly adopted by any commission, bureau, district, or other governmental entity located in the county, pursuant to agreements or memoranda of understanding between the commission on ethics and said entity. The memorandum of understanding or agreement shall include a provision for fees to be paid to the commission on ethics from the public entity in exchange for such benefits at a rate established by the commission on ethics. All fees paid under any such agreement shall be used solely to fund the operations of the commission on ethics and its staff. Any such agreement or memorandum of understanding is subject to final approval of the board, but such approval shall not be unreasonably withheld.

Sec. 2-259. Financial support for the commission.

136 (a) The commission on ethics shall establish a fiscal year which coincides with that of the county. Pursuant to its annual budget process, the county shall provide sufficient financial 137 support for the commission on ethics to fulfill its duties as set forth in this division. The 138

- 139 commission on ethics shall timely submit to the board of county commissioners a budget request 140 including a reasonable estimate of operating and capital expenditures, which request shall not be 141 implemented until approved by the board of county commissioners.
- 142 (b) The commission on ethics budget request shall be prepared on official county budget forms
 143 in a format prescribed by the county office of financial management and budget, shall be
 144 reviewed in a manner similar to that in which of other county departments are reviewed, and
 145 shall be incorporated in the proposed budget and timely submitted to the board of county
 146 commissioners each year. Nothing contained herein shall be construed to prohibit the
 147 commission on ethics from submitting to the board of county commissioners supplemental
 148 budget requests which, if approved, shall constitute amendments to the county budget.
- (c) In addition to budgetary appropriations made by the county, the board of county 149 150 commissioners, may, for the benefit of the commission on ethics, accept grants, contributions or appropriations from the federal government, state government, any municipality within the 151 county, or any academic institution or nonprofit entity which has not entered into a contract or 152 153 transacted business with the county or any governmental entity subject to the provisions of this ordinance. The commission on ethics may accept grants, contributions or appropriations from an 154 155 academic institution or nonprofit entity which has entered into a contract or transacted business 156 with the county if the board of county commissioners by resolution approves the grant, 157 contribution, or appropriation. No other grants, contributions or appropriations may be accepted 158 by the commission on ethics.

Sec. 2-260. Procedure on Complaints filed.

(a) Filing of complaints.

159 160

161

162

163

164

165

166

167

168

169

170

171

172

173 174

175

176

177

178

179 180

181

182

183

- (1) Any person may file a complaint with the commission on ethics.
- (2) The Inspector General, Executive Director of the Commission on Ethics or the State Attorney may file a complaint with the commission on ethics.
- (b) Legal sufficiency of complaints.
 - (1) In order to be found legally sufficient, complaints filed by persons under section (a)1 above, must:
 - a. Be in writing, and executed on a form prescribed by the commission on ethics;
 - b. Allege the elements of a violation within the commission on ethics' jurisdiction in the complaint and/or supporting documents provided;
 - c. Be based substantially upon the personal knowledge of the complainant; and
 - d. Be signed under oath or affirmation by the complaining person.
 - (2) In order to be found legally sufficient, complaints filed by the Inspector General, Executive Director of the Commission on Ethics or the State Attorney, must:
 - a. Be in writing, and executed on a form prescribed by the commission on ethics;
 - b. Allege the elements of a violation within the commission on ethics' jurisdiction in the complaint and/or supporting documents provided;
 - c. Be sworn to by the person filing the complaint before a notary public and contain the following language: "Personally known to me and appeared before me, _____, whose signature appears below, being duly sworn, says that the allegations set forth in this complaint are based upon facts which have been sworn to as true by a material witness or witnesses and which if true would constitute the offenses alleged and that this complaint is instituted in good faith."

Upon a finding of legal sufficiency by the executive director, the commission on ethics shall initiate a preliminary investigation.

- (c) Documents Provided to the Respondent. Within twenty (20) days of a legal sufficiency finding, a copy of the complaint and all documents in support thereof shall be sent to the alleged violator, otherwise known as the respondent.
- (d) Preliminary investigation and public hearing. A preliminary investigation shall be undertaken by the commission on ethics of each legally sufficient complaint over which the commission on ethics has jurisdiction to determine whether there is probable cause to believe that a violation has occurred. If, upon completion of the preliminary investigation, the commission on ethics finds no probable cause to believe that a violation has been committed, the commission on ethics shall dismiss the complaint with the issuance of a report to the complainant and the respondent. If the commission on ethics finds from the preliminary investigation probable cause to believe that a violation has been committed, it shall set the matter for a public hearing and notify complainant and respondent via certified mail, hand delivery, or courier. The commission on ethics may conduct such further investigation as it deems necessary, and may enter into such stipulations and settlements as it finds to be just and in the best interest of the citizens of the county. The public hearing provided for in this section shall be held within one hundred twenty (120) days of the probable cause determination unless extended by the commission on ethics for good cause based on the request of a party or on its own initiative.
- (e) Investigations. Investigations shall be conducted by commission on ethics staff or by any other person or agency so designated by the commission on ethics under the supervision of the executive director and/or the inspector general. Investigations shall be limited to the allegations of the complaint, but shall include an investigation of all facts and persons materially related to the complaint at issue. Subsequent to the filing of a complaint and notice to the respondent, the commission on ethics has an ongoing duty to disclose to the respondent any and all additional documents, statements of witnesses and other evidence, not otherwise subject by statute to nondisclosure, obtained by the commission pursuant to the ongoing investigation of a complaint.
- 213 (f) Counsel.

- 214 (1) Counsel to commission on ethics. The commission on ethics shall select counsel to advise the commission on ethics.
- 216 (2) Advocate. The commission on ethics shall retain legal counsel to serve as the advocate. The advocate shall prosecute cases before the commission on ethics. The executive director may serve as advocate provided the executive director is a member of the Florida Bar in good standing.
- 220 (3) Counsel to the commission on ethics, the advocate, or both may serve on a volunteer basis.
- 221 (4) Respondent. The respondent may appear on his or her own behalf or may be represented by a lawyer. All notices and communications to a respondent represented by a lawyer shall be made through respondent's lawyer.
- 224 (g) Public records exemption. The commission on ethics and its staff shall be considered "an appropriate local official" for the purposes of whistleblower protection provided for in Florida Statutes, § 112.3188(1). The complaint and all records held by the commission on ethics and its staff related to an active preliminary investigation are confidential and exempt from disclosure in a manner consistent with the provisions in Florida Statutes, §112.324(2) and (3) and § 112.3188(2). In addition, any proceeding conducted by the commission on ethics pursuant to a complaint or preliminary investigation is exempt from the provision § 286.011, Florida Statutes,

231 and Article 1, § 24(b), Florida Constitution, as set forth in § 112.324(2) and (3), Florida Statutes.

232 Once a preliminary investigation is complete and a probable cause determination made, all other 233 proceedings conducted pursuant to this subsection shall be public meetings within the meaning 234 of Florida Statutes, ch. 286, and all other documents made or received by the commission on 235 ethics shall be public records within the meaning of Florida Statutes, ch. 119, subject to

236 whistleblower confidentiality as provided for in Florida Statutes § 112.3188(1).

(h) General power of subpoena. The commission on ethics shall be empowered to subpoena and investigate. In the case of a refusal to obey a request for documents or for an interview during an investigation, the commission on ethics may subpoena relevant witnesses and compel their attendance and testimony, administer oaths and affirmations, take evidence, and require by subpoena the production of any books, papers, records, or other relevant items. The commission on ethics may delegate to its staff the authority to administer oaths and affirmations. In the case of a refusal to obey a subpoena issued to any person, the commission on ethics may make application to any circuit court of this state which shall have jurisdiction to order the witness to appear before the commission on ethics and to produce evidence, if so ordered, or to give testimony relevant to the matter in question. Any person who fails to obey the order may be punished in a court of law. Seventy-two (72) hours prior to serving a subpoena, the executive director shall provide written notice to the state attorney and the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of Florida. The commission on ethics shall not interfere with any ongoing criminal investigation or prosecution of the state attorney or the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of Florida. When the state attorney or the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of Florida has explicitly notified the commission on ethics in writing that the commission's investigation is interfering with an ongoing criminal investigation or prosecution, the commission on ethics shall suspend service of subpoena, examination of witnesses, or other investigative activities as set forth in the notice.

256 (i) Subpoenas for discovery. At any time after the commission on ethics orders a public hearing 257 of the matter, the commission on ethics may issue subpoenas, as provided in subsection (h), to 258 effect discovery upon the written request of respondent or advocate. The requesting person shall 259 give the name and address of each witness he or she wishes to have deposed and shall describe with particularity those documents or other items that the person wishes to have the witness 260 261 produce pursuant to a subpoena duces tecum. The chairperson or a member of the commission on 262 ethics designated by the chairperson may issue appropriate orders to effectuate the purposes of discovery and to prevent delay. 263

264 (j) Subpoenas for public hearing. The respondent and the advocate shall submit to the executive 265 director a list of all witnesses he or she wishes to have subpoenaed to attend the hearing. The 266 lists shall contain the correct names and addresses of the witnesses and shall describe with 267 particularity those documents or other items that he or she wishes to have the witness bring to the 268 hearing pursuant to subpoena duces tecum. Subpoenas shall be issued as provided in subsection 269

270 (k) Motions.

237

238

239

240

241

242

243

244 245

246

247

248

249

250

251

252 253

254

255

271 (1) All motions shall be in writing unless made on the record during a hearing, and shall fully 272 state the actions requested and the grounds relied upon. The motion shall include a statement that 273 the movant has conferred with the advocate and all other parties of record and shall state whether 274 there is any objection to the motion.

- 275 (2) The original written motion shall be filed with the commission on ethics and a copy served 276 on all parties or their attorneys. The commission on ethics staff shall send a copy of the motion 277 to the chairperson.
- 278 (3) The chairperson, or a member of the commission on ethics designated by the chairperson, 279 shall conduct such proceedings and make such orders as are deemed necessary to dispose of 280 issues raised by motions, but is not required to hold a hearing on the motion in order to rule upon 281 it.
- 282 (4) Every written motion may be accompanied by, or included in, a written memorandum 283 stating the grounds upon which the motion is based. Other parties to a proceeding may, within 284 seven (7) days of service of a written motion, file written memoranda in opposition.
- 285 (l) Prehearing conferences. The chairperson, or a member of the commission on ethics 286 designated by the chairperson, may conduct one (1) or more prehearing conferences for the 287 purpose of hearing arguments on pending motions, clarifying and simplifying issues, discussing 288 the possibilities of settlement of the issues, examining exhibits and documents, exchanging 289 names and addresses of witnesses, and resolving other procedural matters.
- (m) Exchange of witness lists. Unless otherwise ordered by the chairperson or a member of the 290 291 commission on ethics designated by the chairperson as a result of a prehearing conference, the advocate and the respondent(s) or counsel for respondent(s) shall exchange the names and 292 addresses of witnesses at least ten (10) days prior to the public hearing, with a copy being 293 provided to the chairperson. Names and addresses of witnesses discovered subsequently shall be 294 disclosed to the other party or parties and to the chairperson as soon as possible. Failure to 295 disclose the name and address of a witness may result in the exclusion of the witness's testimony, 296 according to the rule applied in civil judicial proceedings. 297

Sec. 2-260.1. Public hearing procedures.

- (a) Presentation of the case. The advocate shall present his or her case first. Respondent may then present his or her case. Rebuttal evidence may be permitted in the discretion of the commission on ethics.
- 303 (b) Opening and closing statements. Opening and closing statements may be presented by the advocate and the respondent. The advocate may make the first statement and the respondent may follow. Rebuttal by the advocate may be permitted or may be denied.
- 306 (c) Evidence.

298

299 300

301

302

- (1) Stipulations may be received and are encouraged as to uncontested matters.
- 308 (2) Oral evidence shall be taken only on oath or affirmation.
- 309 (3) The respondent and the advocate shall have the right: to present evidence relevant to the issue; to cross-examine opposing witnesses on any matter relevant to the issue; and to impeach any witness regardless who first called him or her to testify.
- 312 (4) The hearing shall not be conducted according to technical rules relating to evidence and witnesses. Any relevant evidence may be admitted. Hearsay evidence may be used to supplement or explain other evidence, but shall not be sufficient itself to support a finding. The rules of privilege shall be effective to the same extent that they are now or hereafter may be recognized in civil actions. Irrelevant and unduly repetitious evidence shall be excluded. The commission on ethics shall not allow the introduction into evidence of an affidavit of a person when that person can be called to testify; this shall not preclude the admission of a deposition of such a person,
- however, for any reason permissible in a court of law under the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure.

- (d) Transcript of proceedings. The proceedings shall be recorded by recording instruments or by a court reporter. Respondent may, at his or her own expense, provide a court reporter or recording instruments. The commission on ethics may provide a court reporter. No transcript of the proceedings shall be prepared unless requested by the commission on ethics or by the respondent. If the respondent requests that a transcript be prepared by a court reporter, the respondent shall pay the expense of transcription. If the Respondent requests that the commission on ethics prepare a transcript from recording instruments and the commission on ethics grants such request, the respondent shall pay the commission on ethics the actual cost of transcription. If a court reporter records the proceedings, the court reporter's transcript shall be the official
- 330 (e) Proposed public report. After the conclusion of the hearing, the respondent and the advocate may present written proposed public reports, within a time designated by the chairperson or a member of the commission on ethics designated by the chairperson. If a proposed public report is filed by the respondent or the advocate, each proposed finding in the proposal that is rejected shall be accompanied by a statement summarizing the reasons for rejection.
 - (f) Motions to dismiss filed by advocate. After probable cause is found and a public hearing is ordered by the commission on ethics, and after further investigation or discovery is made by the advocate, the advocate may move to dismiss the proceeding if the advocate concludes that there is insufficient evidence to proceed to the public hearing in good faith. Such a motion shall specifically state the grounds upon which it is made. The motion shall be heard by the commission on ethics in accordance with the procedure provided for in section 2-260(i).
 - (g) Public order imposing penalty. Upon completion of any hearing initiated under this subsection, the commission on ethics shall make a finding and public report as to whether any provision within its jurisdiction has been violated. If the commission on ethics finds, by clear and convincing evidence, based upon competent substantial evidence in the record, that a violation has been committed, the commission on ethics shall issue an order imposing the appropriate penalty as provided in the ordinance being enforced. The public report and final order shall include a determination as to whether the violation was intentional or unintentional. The commission on ethics shall, within twelve (12) months of the filing of a complaint, render a final order disposing of said complaint unless extended by the commission for good cause. If a person fails to comply with an order issued by the commission on ethics, the commission on ethics may make application to any circuit court of this state which shall have jurisdiction to order the violator to comply with the order of the commission on ethics. Any violator who fails to obey the order may be punished by the court.

Sec. 2-260.2. Notification and referral to other authorities.

As provided for by ordinance within its jurisdiction, the commission on ethics shall refer a matter to the state attorney or any other appropriate official or agency having authority to initiate prosecution when deemed appropriate. The state attorney or other appropriate agency may decline prosecution or enforcement of any matter referred under this division and refer the matter back to the commission on ethics. The commission on ethics shall notify the State of Florida Commission on Ethics, the state attorney, the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of Florida, and other appropriate law enforcement agencies within ten (10) days of a finding of no probable cause or of a final order disposing of a complaint.

Sec. 2-260.3. Dismissal of complaints.

 Notwithstanding any other provisions of this division, the commission on ethics may, at its discretion: (a) dismiss any complaint at any stage of disposition should it determine that the public interest would not be served by proceeding further, or (b) dismiss any complaint at any stage of disposition and issue a letter of instruction to the respondent when it appears that the alleged violation was inadvertent, unintentional or insubstantial. In the event the commission on ethics dismisses a complaint as provided in this subsection, the commission on ethics shall issue a public report stating with particularity its reasons for the dismissal. The commission on ethics may, at the request of the state attorney or any other law enforcement agency, stay an ongoing proceeding. The commission on ethics shall not interfere with any ongoing criminal investigation of the state attorney or the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of Florida.

Sec. 2-260.4. Frivolous or groundless complaints.

In any case in which the commission on ethics determines that the complaining party filed a frivolous or groundless complaint as defined in Florida Statutes, § 57.105, or a complaint with malicious intent and with the knowledge that the complaint contains one or more false allegations, or with reckless disregard for whether the complaint contains material false allegations, the commission on ethics shall order the complaining party to pay any costs and attorney's fees incurred by the commission on ethics and/or the alleged violator. The determination by the commission on ethics regarding whether a complaint is frivolous or groundless shall be deemed conclusive.

Sec. 2-260.5. Effect on other laws.

The provisions of this division shall be deemed supplemental to any other applicable county ordinance or state or federal law and are not intended to replace or repeal any provision of state or federal law or of this Code.

Sec. 2-260.6. Prospective jurisdiction.

The commission on ethics shall be empowered to consider alleged violations within its jurisdiction committed on or after the effective date of the ordinances set forth in section 2-258(a), as each may be amended from time to time. Any alleged violation committed before the effective date of any such ordinance or amendment shall be governed by the applicable law in effect at the time of the alleged violation.

Sec. 2-260.7. Personnel proceeding.

Where an employee of the county or other governmental entity subject to the jurisdiction of this ordinance is alleged to have violated an ordinance within the jurisdiction of the commission on ethics and, based upon the same set of facts, is subject to an ongoing disciplinary action initiated by the county or other governmental entity subject to the jurisdiction of this ordinance the commission on ethics shall stay consideration of a complaint until the conclusion of the personnel proceeding. Nothing herein shall abridge employees' constitutional right to collective bargaining.

Sec. 2-260.8. Statute of limitations.

No action may be taken on a complaint filed more than two (2) years after the violation is alleged to have occurred unless a person, by fraud or other device, prevents discovery of the violation. Where the allegations are the subject of a personnel proceeding or where the complainant is required to exhaust his or her administrative remedies prior to filing a complaint, the statute of limitations shall be tolled until the termination of said personnel proceeding or the exhaustion of administrative remedies.

Sec. 2-260.9. Advisory opinion.

Any person within the jurisdiction of the commission on ethics, when in doubt about the applicability or interpretation of any provision within the commission on ethics' jurisdiction to himself or herself in a particular context, may submit in writing the facts of the situation to the commission on ethics with a request for an advisory opinion to establish the standard of public duty, if any. A person requesting an advisory opinion may withdraw the request at any time up to ten days before the commission on ethics convenes a public meeting to consider the request. An advisory opinion shall be rendered by the commission on ethics on a timely basis, and each such opinion shall be numbered, dated and published.

Sec. 2-260.10. Appeals.

(a) Any final order of the commission on ethics may be appealed by filing a petition for writ of certiorari in the Fifteenth Judicial Circuit Court in and for Palm Beach County. The commission on ethics shall provide the index and record on appeal when required by, and in accordance with, the Florida Rules of Appellate Procedure. A fee shall be charged by the commission on ethics for the preparation and transmission of the record on appeal to the court of appropriate jurisdiction. Such fee may be waived by the executive director if the party requesting the record is indigent.

(b) Costs or fees may not be assessed against the commission on ethics in any appeal from a final order or advisory opinion issued by the commission on ethics pursuant to this division.

(c) Unless specifically ordered by the commission on ethics or by a court of competent jurisdiction, the commencement of an appeal does not suspend or stay a final order or advisory opinion of the commission on ethics.

DIVISION 8. COMMISSION ON ETHICS*

*Cross references: Code of ethics, § 2-441 et seq.

Sec. 2-254. Creation and jurisdiction.

The Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics (hereinafter "commission on ethics") is hereby established. The jurisdiction of the commission on ethics shall extend to any person required to comply with the countywide code of ethics, the eountywidecounty lobbyist registration ordinance, and the eountywidecounty post-employment ordinance, and may further extend to persons or entities required to comply with additional ordinances and regulations duly adopted by other county, local, or municipal government and any commission, bureau, district, or other governmental entity located in Palm Beach County as more fully set forth below. The jurisdiction of the commission on ethics is not exclusive. Any person or entity subject to a complaint to the county's commission on ethics may also be subject to a separate complaint to the state commission on ethics or pursuant to a municipality's ethics ordinance. A finding by the county's commission on ethics is not binding on the state and may not be binding on the municipality, depending on the nature of the complaint and whether the municipality's ethics ordinance is more restrictive than the countywide ethics code.

(Ord: No. 2009 050, § 1, 12-15-09)

Sec. 2-255. Membership, qualifications, terms, vacancies.

- (a) Composition and appointment. The commission on ethics shall be composed of five (5) voting members. The members of the commission on ethics shall be appointed as follows:
- (1) The president of the county association of chiefs of police shall be requested to appoint a former law enforcement official with experience in investigating white collar crime or public corruption.
- (2) The president of the Hispanic Bar Association of Palm Beach County, the president of the F.
 Malcolm Cunningham, Sr. Bar Association, and the president of the county bar association shall
 be requested to appoint an attorney with experience in ethics regulation of public officials and
 employees.
- 34 (3) The president of Florida Atlantic University (FAU) shall be requested to appoint a faculty
 35 member who teaches at an institution of higher education with a campus located in the county
 36 and who has taught a course in professional legal ethics or has published or performed services
 37 in the field of professional legal ethics.
- 38 (4) The president of the Palm Beach Chapter of the Florida Institute of CPAs shall be requested 39 to appoint a member who possesses at least five (5) years experience as a certified public 40 accountant (CPA) with forensic audit experience.
- 41 (5) The board of directors of the Palm Beach County League of Cities, Inc. shall be requested to 42 appoint a person who has served as a former elected official for a governmental entity in the 43 county.
- All appointing officers or entities identified in subsections (a)(1) through (5) shall in good faith endeavor to appoint members of the commission on ethics within forty-five (45) days of the

- effective date of the ordinance from which this division is derived. Each appointing entity shall promptly provide notice of each appointment to the county administrator.
- (b) Additional qualifications. Each member of the commission on ethics shall be of outstanding reputation for integrity, responsibility and commitment to serving the community. The members of the commission on ethics should be representative of the community-at-large and should reflect the racial, gender and ethnic make-up of the community. Before entering upon the duties of office, each appointee on the commission on ethics shall take the prescribed oath of office pursuant to Florida Statutes, § 876.05. Constitution, Art. II §5(b). Members of the commission on ethics shall serve without compensation.
- (c) Term. The members of the commission on ethics shall serve staggered terms of four (4) years each, provided that of the original members, two (2) members described in subsections (a)(1) and (2) shall be appointed for an initial term of two (2) years. The remaining three (3) members shall be appointed for an initial term of four (4) years. Thereafter, all members of the commission on ethics shall serve terms of four (4) years.
- 60 (d) Vacancies. A vacancy occurring during or at the expiration of a member's term on the commission on ethics shall be filled as provided in subsections (a) and (b), no later than sixty
- 62 (60) days after the vacancy occurs.
 63 (e) Additional requirements. No individual while a member of the commission on ethics
- 63 (e) Additional requirements. No individual, while a member of the commission on ethics, shall:
- 65 (1) Hold or campaign for any elective political office;
- 66 (2) Hold office in any political party or political committee;
- 67 (3) Actively participate in or contribute to any political action committee, or to any campaign 68 for state or local office or for any U.S. Congressional or Senate office serving the State of 69 Florida;
- 70 (4) Be employed by Palm Beach County, any municipality within the county, or any other governmental entity subject to the authority of the commission on ethics or the inspector general; or
 - (5) Allow his or her name to be used by a campaign in support of or against any candidate for political office or any referendum or other ballot question. Nothing herein shall preclude a member of the commission on ethics from signing a petition in support of or against any referendum or other ballot question.

77 | (Ord. No. 2009-050, § 2, 12-15-09)

73

74

75

76

78

79 80

81 82

83

84 85

Sec. 2-256. Applicability of code of ethics ordinance.

The countywide code of ethics ordinance shall be applicable to all persons and/or entities within the jurisdiction of said ordinance and shall specifically apply to the members and staff of the commission on ethics.

Ord. No. 2009 050, § 3, 12 15 09)

Sec. 2-257. Organization.

- 86 (a) The commission on ethics shall elect one (1) of its voting members as chairperson who shall serve a term of two (2) years. No chairperson shall be permitted to serve two (2) consecutive terms.
- 89 (b) The commission on ethics shall adopt bylaws and rules of procedure which are consistent 90 with the provisions of this division and rules and regulations for the commission on ethics'

- governance. The commission on ethics shall hold regular meetings in accordance with the bylaws of the commission and may hold such other meetings as it deems necessary.
 - (c) All meetings of the commission on ethics shall be public, and written minutes of the proceedings thereof shall be maintained by the commission on ethics. All actions taken at the meetings of the commission on ethics shall be promptly and properly recorded. Copies of all minutes, resolutions, decisions or advisory opinions of the commission on ethics shall be forwarded to the clerk to the board of county commissioners no later than thirty (30) days subsequent to any meeting of the commission on ethics.
 - (d) The commission on ethics shall be empowered to appoint an executive director and to remove such appointee at will. The commission on ethics shall utilize a competitive selection process when selecting an executive director. The commission on ethics shall fix the executive director's salary, subject to ultimate budget approval by the board of county commissioners. The executive director shall be empowered to appoint, remove, and suspend employees or agents of the commission on ethics, subject to ultimate budget approval by the board of county commissioners. The executive director shall be further empowered to adopt personnel and management policies consistent with like policies in place for county personnel.

(Ord. No. 2009 050, § 4, 12 15 09)

Sec. 2-258. Powers and duties.

- (a) The commission on ethics shall be authorized to exercise such powers and shall be required to perform such duties as are hereinafter provided. The commission on ethics shall be empowered to review, interpret, render advisory opinions and enforce the:
- (1) Countywide Code of Ethics;
- (2) Countywide County Post-employment Ordinance; and
- (3) Countywide County Lobbyist Registration Ordinance.
- (b)—It is anticipated that taxing districts, and other public officials and entities will recognize and desire to benefit from the services of the commission on ethics. The commission on ethics may additionally be empowered to review, interpret, render advisory opinions, and enforce similar rules or regulations duly adopted by any commission, bureau, district, or other governmental entity located in the county, pursuant to agreements or memoranda of understanding between the commission on ethics and said—entity. The memorandum of understanding or agreement shall include a provision for fees to be paid to the commission on ethics from the public entity in exchange for such benefits at a rate established by the commission on ethics. All fees paid under any such agreement shall be used solely to fund the operations of the commission on ethics and its staff. Any such agreement or memorandum of understanding is subject to final approval of the board, but such approval shall not be unreasonably withheld.
- (c) As set forth in the countywide office of inspector general ordinance (Ord. No. 2009-049), (b) As set forth in the countywide office of inspector general ordinance, the commission on ethics shall serve with one (1) delegate each from the state attorney's office and public defender's office for the Fifteenth Judicial Circuit as the selectioninspector general committee. The selectioninspector general committee shall be authorized to select the inspector general, to determine whether or not to renew the term of an inspector general, and to remove participate in the removal of the inspector general as set forth in greater detail in the eountycountywide office of inspector general ordinance.

- 135 | (d)—c)The commission on ethics shall from time to time review ordinances and state and federal laws relating to ethics in government and shall report and make recommendations to the board of county commissioners and municipal elected officials as it deems appropriate.
- 138 (e) d)The commission on ethics shall develop and deliver ethics training and outreach programs
 139 for the benefit of county and municipal employees and officials, county and municipal vendors,
 140 nonprofit corporations, and other entities that do business with or are regulated by the county or
 141 the municipalities located with within the county. The commission on ethics may recommend that
 142 the board enter into agreements with other entities to provide such training and outreach
 143 programs to be administered by the commission on ethics.

144 | (Ord. No. 2009-050, § 5, 12-15-09)

l

Sec. 2-258.1 Extended jurisdiction by interagency agreements.

It is anticipated that taxing districts, and other public officials and entities will recognize and desire to benefit from the services of the commission on ethics. The commission on ethics may additionally be empowered to review, interpret, render advisory opinions, and enforce similar rules or regulations duly adopted by any commission, bureau, district, or other governmental entity located in the county, pursuant to agreements or memoranda of understanding between the commission on ethics and said entity. The memorandum of understanding or agreement shall include a provision for fees to be paid to the commission on ethics from the public entity in exchange for such benefits at a rate established by the commission on ethics. All fees paid under any such agreement shall be used solely to fund the operations of the commission on ethics and its staff. Any such agreement or memorandum of understanding is subject to final approval of the board, but such approval shall not be unreasonably withheld.

Sec. 2-259. Financial support for the commission.

- (a) The commission on ethics shall establish a fiscal year which coincides with that of the county. Pursuant to its annual budget process, the county shall provide sufficient financial support for the commission on ethics to fulfill its duties as set forth in this division. The commission on ethics shall timely submit to the board of county commissioners a budget request including a reasonable estimate of operating and capital expenditures, which request shall not be implemented until approved by the board of county commissioners. In order to ensure adequate funding for the prompt establishment of the commission on ethics, the board of county commissioners hereby approves an amount equal to one hundred eighty thousand dollars (\$180,000.00) to fund all commission on ethics operations for the remainder of the 2009–2010 fiscal year.
- (b) The commission on ethics budget request shall be prepared on official county budget forms in a format prescribed by the county office of financial management and budget, shall be reviewed in a manner similar to that in which of other county departments are reviewed, and shall be incorporated in the proposed budget and timely submitted to the board of county commissioners each year. Nothing contained herein shall be construed to prohibit the commission on ethics from submitting to the board of county commissioners supplemental budget requests which, if approved, shall constitute amendments to the county budget.
- (c) In addition to budgetary appropriations made by the county, the <u>board of county commissioners</u>, may, for the <u>benefit of the commission</u> on ethics—may, accept grants, contributions or appropriations from the federal government, state government, any municipality within the county, or any academic institution or nonprofit entity which has not entered into a contract or transacted business with the county, or any governmental entity subject to the

provisions of this ordinance. The commission on ethics may accept grants, contributions or appropriations from an academic institution or nonprofit entity which has entered into a contract or transacted business with the county if the board of county commissioners by resolution approves the grant, contribution, or appropriation. No other grants, contributions or appropriations may be accepted by the commission on ethics.

(Ord. No. 2009-050, § 6, 12-15-09)

Sec. 2-260.- Procedure on complaints Complaints filed.

(a) (a) Legally sufficient complaints. Filing of complaints.

- (1) Any person may file a complaint with the commission on ethics. Within thirty (30) days after receipt of a complaint by the commission on ethics, a copy shall be sent to the alleged violator, otherwise known as the respondent.
- (2) The eommission shall investigate all Inspector General, Executive Director of the Commission on Ethics or the State Attorney may file a complaint with the commission on ethics.
- (b) Legal sufficiency of complaints following a finding by the executive director, with advice of counsel to the commission on ethics, that the complaint is legally sufficient.
- (1) In order to be found legally sufficient, a complaints filed by persons under section (a)1 above, must:-
 - <u>a.</u> (1)—Be in writing, and executed on a form prescribed by the commission on ethics;
 - <u>b. (2)</u> Allege the elements of a violation within the commission on <u>ethics'ethics'</u> jurisdiction in the complaint and/or supporting documents provided;
 - c. (3)—Be based substantially upon the personal knowledge of the complainant; and

d. (4)—Be signed under oath or affirmation by the complaining person.

Upon a finding of legal sufficiency by the executive director, the commission on ethics shall initiate a preliminary investigation.

- (2) (b) Complaints filed by inspector general, executive director or state attorney. The inspector general, executive director of the commission on ethics or the state attorney may file a complaint with the commission on ethics. In order to be found legally sufficient, the complaints filed by the Inspector General, Executive Director of the Commission on Ethics or the State Attorney, must-be:
 - a. Be in writing, and executed on a form prescribed by the commission on ethics;
 - b. Allege the elements of a violation within the commission on ethics' jurisdiction in the complaint and/or supporting documents provided;
 - c. Be sworn to by the person filing the complaint before a notary public and contain the following language: "Personally known to me and appeared before me, _______, whose signature appears below, being duly sworn, says that the allegations set forth in this complaint are based upon facts which have been sworn to as true by a material witness or witnesses and which if true would constitute the offenses alleged and that this complaint is instituted in good faith. Within five (5) days after receipt of the complaint by the commission on ethics, a copy of the complaint shall be sent to the alleged violator, otherwise known as the respondent..."

224 (c

<u>Upon a finding of legal sufficiency by the executive director, the commission on ethics shall initiate a preliminary investigation.</u>

227 228

229

230

231

232 233

234 235

236

237 238

239 240

241

242

243

244

245

246

247

248

249

250 251

252

253

254

255

256

257

258

259

260 261

265 266

267

(c) Documents Provided to the Respondent. Within twenty (20) days of a legal sufficiency finding, a copy of the complaint and all documents in support thereof shall be sent to the alleged violator, otherwise known as the respondent.

(d) Preliminary investigation and public hearing. A preliminary investigation shall be undertaken by the commission on ethics of each legally sufficient complaint over which the commission on ethics has jurisdiction to determine whether there is probable cause to believe that a violation has occurred. If, upon completion of the preliminary investigation, the commission on ethics finds no probable cause to believe that a violation has been committed, the commission on ethics shall dismiss the complaint with the issuance of a report to the complainant and the respondent. If the commission on ethics finds from the preliminary investigation probable cause to believe that a violation has been committed, it shall notify complainant and respondent via certified mail, hand delivery, or courier, informing the person of his or her right to request a hearing within thirty (30) days of receipt of the notice. Upon request submitted to the commission on ethics in writing, any person who the commission on ethics finds probable cause to believe has committed a violation of a provision within its jurisdiction shall be entitled to a public hearing. Such person shall be deemed to have waived the right to a public hearing if the request is not received within thirty (30) days following receipt of the probable cause notification required by this subsection. The commission on ethics may on its own motion require a public hearing, set the matter for a public hearing and notify complainant and respondent via certified mail, hand delivery, or courier. The commission on ethics may conduct such further investigation as it deems necessary, and may enter into such stipulations and settlements as it finds to be just and in the best interest of the citizens of the county. The public hearing provided for in this section shall be held within ninety (90 one hundred twenty (120) days of the probable cause determination unless extended by the commission on ethics for good cause based on the request of a party or on its own initiative.

(d)—e) Investigations. Investigations shall be conducted by commission on ethics staff or by any other person or agency so designated by the commission on ethics under the supervision of the executive director and/or the inspector general. Investigations shall be limited to the allegations of the complaint, but shall include an investigation of all facts and persons materially related to the complaint at issue.—Subsequent to the filing of a complaint and notice to the respondent, the commission on ethics has an ongoing duty to disclose to the respondent any and all additional documents, statements of witnesses and other evidence, not otherwise subject by statute to nondisclosure, obtained by the commission pursuant to the ongoing investigation of a complaint.

(e)_<u>f)</u> Counsel.

- (1) Counsel to commission on ethics. The commission on ethics shall select counsel to advise the commission on ethics.
 (2) Advocate. The commission on ethics shall retain legal counsel to serve as the advocate. The
 - (2) Advocate. The commission on ethics shall retain legal counsel to serve as the advocate. The advocate shall prosecute cases before the commission on ethics. The executive director may serve as advocate provided the executive director is a member of the Florida Bar in good standing.
- 268 (3) Counsel to the commission on ethics, the advocate, or both may serve on a volunteer basis.
- 269 (4) Respondent. The respondent may appear on his or her own behalf or may be represented by a lawyer. All notices and communications to a respondent represented by a lawyer shall be made through respondent's lawyer.

(f)—g) Public records exemption. The commission on ethics and its staff shall be considered "an appropriate local official" for the purposes of whistleblower protection provided for in Florida Statutes, § 112.3188(1). With the exception of the initial The complaint filed in a matter, and all records held by the commission on ethics and its staff related to an active preliminary investigation are confidential and exempt from disclosure in a manner consistent with the provisions in Florida Statutes, § 112.3188(2).112.324(2) and (3) and § 112.3188(2). In addition, any proceeding conducted by the commission on ethics pursuant to a complaint or preliminary investigation is exempt from the provision § 286.011, Florida Statutes, and Article 1, § 24(b), Florida Constitution, as set forth in § 112.324(2)(a) and (3), Florida Statutes. Once a preliminary investigation is complete and a probable cause determination made, all other proceedings conducted pursuant to this subsection shall be public meetings within the meaning of Florida Statutes, ch. 286, and all other documents made or received by the commission on ethics shall be public records within the meaning of Florida Statutes, ch. 119.119, subject to whistleblower confidentiality as provided for in Florida Statutes § 112.3188(1).

310 |

(g) <u>h</u> General power of subpoena. The commission on ethics shall be empowered to subpoena and investigate. In the case of a refusal to obey a request for documents or for an interview during an investigation, the commission on ethics may subpoena relevant witnesses and compel their attendance and testimony, administer oaths and affirmations, take evidence, and require by subpoena the production of any books, papers, records, or other relevant items. The commission on ethics may delegate to its staff the authority to administer oaths and affirmations. In the case of a refusal to obey a subpoena issued to any person, the commission on ethics may make application to any circuit court of this state which shall have jurisdiction to order the witness to appear before the commission on ethics and to produce evidence, if so ordered, or to give testimony touching on relevant to the matter in question. Any person who fails to obey the order may be punished in a court of law. Seventy-two (72) hours prior to serving a subpoena, the executive director shall provide written notice to the state attorney and the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of Florida. The commission on ethics shall not interfere with any ongoing criminal investigation or prosecution of the state attorney or the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of Florida. When the state attorney or the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of Florida has explicitly notified the commission on ethics in writing that the commission's investigation is interfering with an ongoing criminal investigation or prosecution, the commission on ethics shall suspend service of subpoena, examination of witnesses, or other investigative activities as set forth in the notice.

(h)—i) Subpoenas for discovery; discovery. At any time after the commission on ethics orders a public hearing of the matter, the commission on ethics may issue subpoenas, as provided in subsection (gh), to effect discovery upon the written request of respondent or advocate. The requesting person shall give the name and address of each witness he or she wishes to have deposed and shall describe with particularity those documents or other items that the person wishes to have the witness produce pursuant to a subpoena -duces tecum—. The chairperson or a member of the commission on ethics designated by the chairperson may issue appropriate orders to effectuate the purposes of discovery and to prevent delay.

(i)—j) Subpoenas for public hearing. The respondent and the advocate shall submit to the executive director a list of all witnesses he or she wishes to have subpoenaed to attend the hearing. The lists shall contain the correct names and addresses of the witnesses and shall describe with particularity those documents or other items that he or she wishes to have the

- witness bring to the hearing pursuant to subpoena -duces tecum—. Subpoenas shall be issued as provided in subsection (gh).
- 319 $\frac{(j)-k}{Motions}$.
- 320 (1) All motions shall be in writing unless made on the record during a hearing, and shall fully 321 state the actions requested and the grounds relied upon. The motion shall include a statement that 322 the movant has conferred with the advocate and all other parties of record and shall state whether 323 there is any objection to the motion.
- 324 (2) The original written motion shall be filed with the commission on ethics and a copy served 325 on all parties or their attorneys. The commission on ethics staff shall send a copy of the motion 326 to the chairperson.
- 327 (3) The chairperson, or a member of the commission on ethics designated by the chairperson, 328 shall conduct such proceedings and make such orders as are deemed necessary to dispose of 329 issues raised by motions, but is not required to hold a hearing on the motion in order to rule upon 330 it.
- 331 (4) Every written motion may be accompanied by, or included in, a written memorandum 332 stating the grounds upon which the motion is based. Other parties to a proceeding may, within 333 seven (7) days of service of a written motion, file written memoranda in opposition.
- 334 (k)—1) Prehearing conferences. The chairperson, or a member of the commission on ethics designated by the chairperson, may conduct one (1) or more prehearing conferences for the purpose of hearing arguments on pending motions, clarifying and simplifying issues, discussing the possibilities of settlement of the issues, examining exhibits and documents, exchanging names and addresses of witnesses, and resolving other procedural matters.
- 339 (1) Exchange of witness lists. Unless otherwise ordered by the chairperson or a member of 340 the commission on ethics designated by the chairperson as a result of a prehearing conference, 341 the advocate and the respondent(s) or counsel for respondent(s) shall exchange the names and 342 addresses of witnesses at least ten (10) days prior to the public hearing, with a copy being 343 provided to the chairperson. Names and addresses of witnesses discovered subsequently shall be 344 disclosed to the other party or parties and to the chairperson as soon as possible. Failure to 345 disclose the name and address of a witness may result in the exclusion of the witness's testimony, 346 according to the rule applied in civil judicial proceedings.
- 347 | (Ord. No. 2009-050, § 7, 12-15-09; Ord. No. 2010-042, pt. 1, 9-28-10)

Sec. 2-260.1. Public hearing procedures.

- (a) Presentation of the case. The advocate shall present his or her case first. Respondent may then present his or her case. Rebuttal evidence may be permitted in the discretion of the commission on ethics.
- (b) Opening and closing statements. Opening and closing statements may be presented by the
 advocate and the respondent. The advocate may make the first statement and the respondent may
 follow. Rebuttal by the advocate may be permitted or may be denied.
- 356 (c) Evidence.

348 349

350

351

- 357 (1) Stipulations may be received and are encouraged as to uncontested matters.
- 358 (2) Oral evidence shall be taken only on oath or affirmation.
- 359 (3) The respondent and the advocate shall have the right: to present evidence relevant to the 360 issue; to cross-examine opposing witnesses on any matter relevant to the issue; and to impeach 361 any witness regardless who first called him or her to testify.

(4) The hearing shall not be conducted according to technical rules relating to evidence and witnesses. Any relevant evidence may be admitted. Hearsay evidence may be used to supplement or explain other evidence, but shall not be sufficient itself to support a finding. The rules of privilege shall be effective to the same extent that they are now or hereafter may be recognized in civil actions. Irrelevant and unduly repetitious evidence shall be excluded. The commission on ethics shall not allow the introduction into evidence of an affidavit of a person when that person can be called to testify; this shall not preclude the admission of a deposition of such a person, however, for any reason permissible in a court of law under the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure. (d) Transcript of proceedings. The proceedings shall be recorded by recording instruments or by a court reporter. Respondent may, at his or her own expense, provide a court reporter or recording instruments. The commission on ethics may provide a court reporter. No transcript of the proceedings shall be prepared unless requested by the commission on ethics or by the respondent. If the respondent requests that a transcript be prepared by a court reporter, the respondent shall pay the expense of transcription. If the Respondent requests that the commission on ethics prepare a transcript from recording instruments and the commission on ethics grants such request, the respondent shall pay the commission on ethics the actual cost of transcription. If a court reporter records the proceedings, the court reporter's transcript shall be the official transcript.

- (e) Proposed public report. After the conclusion of the hearing, the respondent and the advocate may present written proposed public reports, within a time designated by the chairperson or a member of the commission on ethics designated by the chairperson. If a proposed public report is filed by the respondent or the advocate, each proposed finding in the proposal that is rejected shall be accompanied by a statement summarizing the reasons for rejection.
- (f) Motions to dismiss filed by advocate. After probable cause is found and a public hearing is ordered by the commission on ethics, and after further investigation or discovery is made by the advocate, the advocate may move to dismiss the proceeding if the advocate concludes that there is insufficient evidence to proceed to the public hearing in good faith. Such a motion shall specifically state the grounds upon which it is made. The motion shall be heard by the commission on ethics in accordance with the procedure provided for in section 2-260(i).
- (g) Public order imposing penalty. Upon completion of any hearing initiated under this subsection, the commission on ethics shall make a finding and public report as to whether any provision within its jurisdiction has been violated. If the commission on ethics finds, by clear and convincing evidence, based upon competent substantial evidence in the record, that a violation has been committed, the commission on ethics shall issue an order imposing the appropriate penalty as provided in the ordinance being enforced. The public report and final order shall include a determination as to whether the violation was intentional or unintentional. The commission on ethics shall, within twelve (12) months of the filing of a complaint, render a final order disposing of said complaint unless extended by the commission for good cause. If a person fails to comply with an order issued by the commission on ethics, the commission on ethics may make application to any circuit court of this state which shall have jurisdiction to order the violator to comply with the order of the commission on ethics. Any violator who fails to obey the order may be punished by the court.

 (Ord. No. 2009-050, § 8, 12-15-09)

Sec. 2-260.2. Notification and referral to other authorities.

As provided for by ordinance within its jurisdiction, the commission on ethics shall refer a matter to the state attorney or any other appropriate official or agency having authority to initiate prosecution when deemed appropriate. The state attorney or other appropriate agency may decline prosecution or enforcement of any matter referred under this division and refer the matter back to the commission on ethics. The commission on ethics shall notify the State of Florida Commission on Ethics, the state attorney, the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of Florida, and other appropriate law enforcement agencies within ten (10) days of a finding of no probable cause or of a final order disposing of a complaint.

(Ord. No. 2009 050, § 9, 12-15-09)

Sec. 2-260.3. Dismissal of complaints.

Notwithstanding any other provisions of this division, the commission on ethics may, at its discretion: (a) dismiss any complaint at any stage of disposition should it determine that the public interest would not be served by proceeding further, or (b) dismiss any complaint at any stage of disposition and issue a letter of instruction to the respondent when it appears that the alleged violation was inadvertent, unintentional or insubstantial. In the event the commission on ethics dismisses a complaint as provided in this subsection, the commission on ethics shall issue a public report stating with particularity its reasons for the dismissal. The commission on ethics may, at the request of the state attorney or any other law enforcement agency, stay an ongoing proceeding. The commission on ethics shall not interfere with any ongoing criminal investigation of the state attorney or the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of Florida.

(Ord. No. 2009-050, §-10, 12-15-09)

Sec. 2-260.4. Frivolous or groundless complaints.

In any case in which the commission on ethics determines that the complaining party filed a frivolous or groundless complaint as defined in Florida Statutes, § 57.105, or a complaint with malicious intent and with the knowledge that the complaint contains one or more false allegations, or with reckless disregard for whether the complaint contains material false allegations, the commission on ethics shall order the complaining party to pay any costs and attorney's fees incurred by the commission on ethics and/or the alleged violator. The determination by the commission on ethics regarding whether a complaint is frivolous or groundless shall be deemed conclusive.

(Ord. No. 2009-050, § 11, 12-15-09)

Sec. 2-260.5. Effect on other laws.

The provisions of this division shall be deemed supplemental to any other applicable county ordinance or state or federal law and are not intended to replace or repeal any provision of state or federal law or of this Code.

(Ord. No. 2009-050, § 12, 12-15-09)

Sec. 2-260.6. Prospective jurisdiction.

The commission on ethics shall be empowered to consider alleged violations within its jurisdiction committed on or after the effective date of the ordinances set forth in section 2-258(a), as each may be amended from time to time. Any alleged violation committed before the effective date of any such ordinance or amendment shall be governed by the applicable law in effect at the time of the alleged violation.

Sec. 2-260.7. Personnel proceeding.

Where an employee of the county or other governmental entity subject to the jurisdiction of this ordinance is alleged to have violated an ordinance within the jurisdiction of the commission on ethics and, based upon the same set of facts, is subject to an ongoing disciplinary action initiated by the county, or other governmental entity subject to the jurisdiction of this ordinance the commission on ethics shall stay consideration of a complaint until the conclusion of the personnel proceeding. Nothing herein shall abridge employees' constitutional right to collective bargaining.

(Ord. No. 2009-050, §-14, 12-15-09)

Sec. 2-260.8. Statute of limitations.

No action may be taken on a complaint filed more than two (2) years after the violation is alleged to have occurred unless a person, by fraud or other device, prevents discovery of the violation. Where the allegations are the subject of a personnel proceeding or where the complainant is required to exhaust his or her administrative remedies prior to filing a complaint, the statute of limitations shall be tolled until the termination of said personnel proceeding or the exhaustion of administrative remedies.

(Ord. No. 2009-050, § 15, 12-15-09)

Sec. 2-260.9. Advisory opinion.

Any person within the jurisdiction of the commission on ethics, when in doubt about the applicability or interpretation of any provision within the commission on ethics' jurisdiction to himself or herself in a particular context, may submit in writing the facts of the situation to the commission on ethics with a request for an advisory opinion to establish the standard of public duty, if any. A person requesting an advisory opinion may withdraw the request at any time up to ten days before the commission on ethics convenes a public meeting to consider the request. An advisory opinion shall be rendered by the commission on ethics on a timely basis, and each such opinion shall be numbered, dated and published.

(Ord. No. 2009-050, § 16, 12-15-09)

Sec. 2-260.10. Appeals.

- (a) Any final order of the commission on ethics may be appealed by filing a petition for writ of certiorari in the Fifteenth Judicial Circuit Court in and for Palm Beach County. The commission on ethics shall provide the index and record on appeal when required by, and in accordance with, the Florida Rules of Appellate Procedure. A fee shall be charged by the commission on ethics for the preparation and transmission of the record on appeal to the court of appropriate jurisdiction. Such fee may be waived by the executive director if the party requesting the record is indigent.
- (b) Costs or fees may not be assessed against the commission on ethics in any appeal from a final order or advisory opinion issued by the commission on ethics pursuant to this division.
- 495 (c) Unless specifically ordered by the commission on ethics or by a court of competent 496 jurisdiction, the commencement of an appeal does not suspend or stay a final order or advisory 497 opinion of the commission on ethics.
- 498 | (Ord. No. 2009 050, § 17, 12-15-09)

499	
500	
501	
502	
503	
504	
505	
506	\\Server\cwdata\docs\PBC League of Cities\Ethics Ords BCCModelsFall 2010\doc Commission on Ethics
507	Ordinance Pavisions door

Summary of substantive changes

- Provided additional explanation of Commission on Ethics jurisdiction
- Relocated and expanded on provisions allowing entities other than the County and municipalities to contract for Commission on Ethics services
- Reorganized section outlining procedures for filing complaints
- Adding partial exemption to Sunshine Law and Public Records law provided by section 112.324, Florida Statutes
- Amending advisory opinion section to allow a person requesting an advisory opinion to withdraw the request at any time up to ten days before the Commission on Ethics convenes a meeting to consider the request