PALM BEACH COUNTY

BOARD of COUNTY COMMISSIONERS

AGENDA ITEM SUMMARY

II. <u>FISCAL IMPACT ANALYSIS</u>

A. Five Year Summary of Fiscal Impact:

C.

Other Department Review:

Department Director

Fiscal Years	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	
Capital Expenditures						
Operating Costs						
External Revenues						
Program Income (County)						
n-Kind Match (County)						
NET FISCAL IMPACT	None					
ADDITIONAL FTE						
OSITIONS (Cumulative)						
s Item Included In Current I Does this item include the use Budget Account No.: Fund Program Number	of federal fur Agency	nds? Yes V Org. Re	No Obje evenue Source			
8. Recommended Sources of No fiscal impa		iary of Fiscal	Impact:			
. Department Fiscal Re	eview:					
OFMB Fiscal and/or		EVIEW CO				
		المالع المالع س	٨		А	

This summary is not to be used as a basis for payment.



Office of the County Internal Auditor

AUDIT RECOMMENDATION STATUS FOLLOW-UP REPORT AS OF NOVEMBER 15, 2018



 $ISSUED\ December\ 12,\ 2018$

Stewardship – Accountability – Transparency



Internal Auditor's Office

2300 North Jog Road
West Palm Beach, FL 33411
(561) 681-4480
FAX: (561) 681-4490
www.pbcgov.com/internalauditor

Palm Beach County Board of County Commissioners

Melissa McKinlay, Mayor Mack Bernard, Vice Mayor Hal R. Valeche Paulette Burdick Dave Kerner

Steven L. Abrams

Mary Lou Berger

County Administrator

Verdenia C. Baker

"An Equal Opportunity Affirmative Action Employer"

Official Electronic Letterhead

DATE:

December 12, 2018

TO:

The Audit Committee

FROM:

Joseph F. Bergeron, Internal Auditor

SUBJECT:

Audit Recommendation Status Follow-Up Report

Dated November 15, 2018

The Audit Recommendation Status Follow-Up Report providing the status of audit recommendations as of November 15, 2018 is attached. These status reports are prepared semiannually for periods ending on the 15th of May and November. The reports are submitted to the Audit Committee at its meeting following the report "as of" dates. We will submit the reports to the BCC (generally January and July) following Audit Committee review.

The report contains a Summary Status of Audit Recommendations followed by:

- Exhibit 1 Audit Recommendations Open at the Beginning of the May 16, 2018 through November 15, 2018 Reporting Period
- Exhibit 2 Audit Recommendations Issued During the May 16, 2018 through November 15, 2018 Reporting Period
- Exhibit 3 Open Audit Recommendations by County Department at November 15, 2018
- Exhibit 4 Summary Aging of Open Audit Recommendations at November 15, 2018
- Exhibit 5 Recommendation Implementation Dates
- Exhibit 6 Audit Recommendations Submitted for Audit Committee Consideration
- Exhibit 7 Recommendation Status at November 15, 2018

The purpose of this report is to keep the Audit Committee, the BCC and County Administration informed of the status of recommendations made by the Internal Auditor's Office and to facilitate oversight by County Administration on departmental implementation activities.

Exhibit 6 includes recommendations which have had final management action without correcting the underlying condition where

Audit Committee Audit Recommendation Follow-up Report Dated November 15, 2018 Transmittal Letter December 12, 2018 Page 2

we believe additional action is necessary (Part A) or that have been open for at least two years (Part B). Audit recommendation follow-up is conducted to determine if management has implemented the corrective action agreed to during the audit and to ensure the underlying condition has been corrected.

Audit recommendations are proposed by the Internal Auditor's Office and either accepted by management as proposed or management proposes alternate solutions, which are acceptable to Internal Audit. An audit recommendation is "Open" from the time the audit report containing the recommendation has been reviewed by the Audit Committee until management has either implemented the recommendation or decided to take no further action. Audit recommendations remain in this report as long as the recommendation is open. If management chooses to take no further action, Internal Audit reports that in Exhibit 6 and recommends appropriate action to the Audit Committee.

This report tracks every audit recommendation from the date of issuance through to final disposition. Management establishes projected implementation dates for all recommendations during the audit. Internal Audit tracks the projected implementation dates and conducts follow-up on audit recommendations when management confirms the recommendation has been implemented.

If management has not implemented the recommendation by the scheduled implementation date, Internal Audit makes inquiries of management to determine:

- What actions, if any, have been taken by management;
- Why the recommendation has not been implemented as scheduled; and
- When will the recommendation be implemented?

Internal Audit will conduct limited due diligence reviews to determine the validity of management's responses and consult with County Administration to determine if the reasons for delay are reasonable and report delinquencies where appropriate. The recommendation implementation date will be adjusted as necessary based on the new information from management.

Recommendation status is listed in Exhibits 6 and 7 as either:

- Completed The recommendation has been fully implemented or management has implemented alternative actions that achieved the same purpose as the original recommendation, and the actions taken by management have corrected the underlying conditions. Internal Audit review confirms management's actions.
- In process Internal Audit has conducted a follow-up review and found that management has not fully implemented the recommendation and that additional work is necessary to fully implement the recommendation. Management provides a new projected implementation date for the corrective action. Additional follow-up will be required. In some cases, management tells Internal Audit that implementation is underway but not yet complete. In that case Internal Audit will perform limited procedures to verify management's assertion.
- Future implementation The implementation date established by management occurs after the date of this report and Internal Audit has done no review work on the recommendation.
- Follow-up pending The department has reported implementation of the audit recommendation. However, Internal Audit has not yet done the follow-up review work to confirm management's actions.

SUMMARY STATUS OF AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS

November 15, 2018

As of November 15, 2018, the Internal Auditor's Database of Audit Recommendations showed that management actions had not been completed on 36 recommendations. These recommendations are considered "Open". Of those 36 open recommendations, follow-up has been conducted on 21 showing that management action has started but was not yet complete. The other 15 open recommendations are scheduled for follow-up in the future and no audit evaluation has been conducted at this time.

Changes in the inventory of Audit Recommendations during the period May 16, 2018 through November 15, 2018 are shown below:

Open Audit Recommendations as of May 16, 2018	38
Additional Audit Recommendations from Audit Reports Issued May 16, 2018 through November 15, 2018	16
Audit Recommendations Completed May 16, 2018 through November 15, 2018	18
Open Audit Recommendations as of November 15, 2018	36

Recommendation follow-up work is generally conducted within one year of report issuance or earlier if management indicates that final action has been completed. Follow-up is done to determine the following:

- Was the recommendation implemented as agreed to by management? Or, if not, did alternative management action correct the identified deficiency or deficiencies?
- Was the underlying cause (condition) corrected?

Sufficient audit evidence is developed to support a conclusion as to implementation of the recommendation and correction of the underlying cause (condition). If final management action has been taken on an audit recommendation, the recommendation is considered "Complete" and is included in the current report, but not in future reports.

If management action is not complete on any audit recommendation, the recommendation is included in this report as 'In Process." Another audit follow-up will be scheduled. If final management action has been taken and the underlying cause (condition) has not been corrected, we show this recommendation as "Completed - Not Implemented." These recommendations are included in Exhibit 6 for Audit Committee consideration.

Exhibit 1: Audit Recommendations Open at Beginning of the May 16, 2018 through November 15, 2018 Reporting Period

	Report	Issue Date	Number of Open Audit Recommendations Beginning of Reporting Period	Final Management Action Taken During Reporting Period	Number of Open Audit Recommendations End of Reporting Period
15-06	Palm Tran Fixed Route	Mar-15	1	1	0
15-17	Office of Small Business Assistance Revenue Management	Sep-15	1	0	1
17-04	Human Resources Customer Service Processes	Mar-17	5	4	1
17-05	Planning, Zoning, & Building Code Enforcement	Apr-17	7	4	3
18-01	Facilities Development & Operations Capital Project Management Process	Dec-17	8	2	6
18-02	Department of Airports Capital Project Management Process	Dec-17	6	6	0
18-03	Library Department Information Technology Management	Jan-18	10	0	10
	Totals		38	17	21

Exhibit 2: Audit Recommendations Issued During the May 16, 2018 through November 15, 2018 Reporting Period

Report		Issue Date	Number of Audit Recommendations Issued this Reporting Period	Final Management Action Taken During Reporting Period	Number of Open Audit Recommendations End of Reporting Period
18-04	Public Safety Animal Care and Control	Mar-18	7	0	7
18-05	Multiple Departments / OFMB Infrastructure Sales Surtax Program	May-18	3	1	2
18-06	Youth Services Department Internal Controls Review	Jul-18	6	0	6
	Totals		16	1	15

Exhibit 3: Open Audit Recommendations by County Department as of November 15, 2018

Department	In Process	Future Implementation	
Office of Small Business Assistance	1	0	
Human Resources	1	0	
PZB - Code Enforcement	3	0	
Facilities Development & Operations	6	0	
Library	10	0	
Public Safety	0	7	
Multiple Departments / OFMB	0	2	
Youth Services	0	6	
Total Open Recommendations	21	15	

Future implementation
The implementation date established by management occurs after the date of this report and Internal Audit has done no review work on the recommendation(s).

Exhibit 4: Summary Aging of Open Audit Recommendations by Report Issued Date
As of November 15, 2018

Timeframe	Inventory at Beginning of Period (Exhibit 1)	Issued During this Period (Exhibit 2)	Closed During this Period (Exhibits 1 and 2)	Open at the End of this Period	In Process	Future Implementation
0 - 6 Months	0	16	1	15	0	15
7 - 12 Months	24	0	8	16	16	0
13 - 18 Months	7	0	4	3	3	0
19 - 24 Months	5	0	4	1	1	0
Greater Than 24 Months	2	0	1	1	1	0
Total	38	16	18	36	21	15

Audit Report Issuance Dates by Audit Committee Meeting Date

0 - 6 Months	June and September 2018	
7 - 12 Months	December 2017 and March 2018	
13 - 18 Months	June and September 2017	
19 - 24 Months	December 2016 and March 2017	
Over 24 Months	September 2016 or Earlier	-

Future implementation: The implementation date established by management occurs after the date of this report and Internal Audit has done no review work on the recommendation(s).

Exhibit 5 Recommendation Status Report as of November 15, 2018 By Report Number and Implementation Date

A/C Mtg	Panort	Dag	OID	AFD	prn	A TETO	DID	A TOTAL	DID	A ESTS	DID	1 7775	
Date	#	#	UID	AFD	RID	AFD	RID	AFD	RID	AFD	RID	AFD	RID
Date	#	#								-			
Palm Tra	n -Fived	Route	Operation	ne						ļ			
Mar-15	15-06	5		eport issuar	L.								
Mar-15	15-06	6		eport issuar									
Mar-15	15-06	2	Sep-15	Oct-15	complete								
Mar-15	15-06	3	Sep-15	Oct-15	complete								
Mar-15	15-06	7	Sep-15	Oct-15	complete								
Mar-15	15-06	11	Sep-15	Oct-15	complete								
Mar-15	15-06	12	Sep-15	Oct-15	complete								
Mar-15	15-06	13	Sep-15	Oct-15	complete								
Mar-15	15-06	4	Sep-15	Oct-15	Dec-15	Mar-16	complete						
Mar-15	15-06	8	Sep-15	Oct-15	Dec-15	Mar-16	complete						
Mar-15	15-06	9	Sep-15	Oct-15	Dec-15	Mar-16	Dec-16	complete					
Mar-15	15-06	10	Sep-15	Oct-15	Dec-15	Mar-16	Dec-16	complete					
Mar-15	15-06	1	Sep-15	Oct-15	Dec-15	Mar-16	Dec-16	Jun-17	Jul-17	Dec-17	Apr-18	Aug-18	closed
									- V - 1 /	200-17	11p1-10	11ug-10	cioscu
Office of	Small Bu	siness	Assistance	e - Revenu	e Managen	nent							
Sep-15	15-17	1	Mar-16	_	Aug-16	Nov-16	complete						
Sep-15	15-17	2	Mar-16	-	Aug-16	Nov-16	Compiete						
Human R	esources	- Cus	tomer Ser	vice Proces	ses								
Mar-17	17-04	1	Aug-17	Oct-17	complete						*****		****
Mar-17	17-04	2	Aug-17	Oct-17	complete								
Mar-17	17-04	3	Apr-17	Oct-17	complete								
Mar-17	17-04	4	Jul-17	Oct-17	complete								
Mar-17	17-04	5	Feb-18	Oct-17	Jan-19								
									/				
Planning,	Zoning,	& Bu	ilding - Co	de Enforc	ement								
Apr-17	17-05	3	Nov-17	complete									
Apr-17	17-05	4	Nov-17	complete									
Apr-17	17-05	5	Nov-17	complete									
Apr-17	17-05	7	Nov-17	complete									
Apr-17	17-05	8	Nov-17	complete									
Apr-17	17-05	9	Nov-17	complete									
Apr-17	17-05	15	Nov-17	complete									
Apr-17	17-05	1	Nov-17	Jun-18	complete								
Apr-17	17-05	2	Nov-17	Jun-18	complete								
Apr-17	17-05	11	Nov-17	Jun-18	complete								
Apr-17	17-05	12	Nov-17	Jun-18	complete								
Apr-17	17-05	13	Nov-17	Jun-18	complete								
Apr-17	17-05	6	Nov-17	Jun-18	Dec-18								
Apr-17	17-05	10	Nov-17	Jun-18	Dec-18								
Apr-17	17-05	14	Nov-17	Jun-18	Dec-18								
				ns - Capita		/Ianageme	nt Process						
Dec-17	18-01			eport issuan									
Dec-17	18-01	2	Feb-18	May-18									
Dec-17	18-01	3	Dec-17	May-18	complete								
Dec-17	18-01	1	Dec-17	May-18	Oct-18								
Dec-17	18-01	4	Feb-18	May-18	Oct-18								
Dec-17	18-01	5	-	May-18	Oct-18								
Dec-17	18-01	6	-	May-18	Oct-18								
Dec-17	18-01	7	-	May-18	Oct-18								
Dec-17	18-01	8	-	May-18	Oct-18								

Exhibit 5 Recommendation Status Report as of November 15, 2018 By Report Number and Implementation Date

A/C Mtg	Report	Rec	OID	AFD	RID	AFD	RID	AFD	RID	AFD	RID	AFD	RID
Date	#	#		122	100		Kib	ALD	KID	ALD	KID	AFD	KID
***************************************												ļ	
Departme	ent of Air	ports	- Capital I	roject Ma	nagement	Process	L						
Dec-17	18-02	1	Mar-18	Jun-18	complete						 		
Dec-17	18-02	2	Mar-18	Jun-18	complete								
Dec-17	18-02	3	Mar-18	Jun-18	complete								
Dec-17	18-02	4	-	Jun-18	complete								* * *
Dec-17	18-02	5	Mar-18	Jun-18	complete								
Dec-17	18-02	6	Mar-18	Jun-18	complete				.,				
Library D)epartme	nt - Iı	nformation	Technolo	gy Manage	ment							
Mar-18	18-03	11	closed at re	port issuar	ice								
Mar-18	18-03	1	Jan-19	Jul-18	Oct-18								
Mar-18	18-03	2	Jan-19	Jul-18	Oct-18								
Mar-18	18-03	3	Oct-18	Jul-18	Oct-18								
Mar-18	18-03	4	Oct-18	Jul-18	Oct-18								·····
Mar-18	18-03	5	Oct-18	Jul-18	Oct-18						***************************************		
Mar-18	18-03	6	Jun-18	Jul-18	Oct-18								
Mar-18	18-03	7	Oct-18	Jul-18	Oct-18								
Mar-18	18-03	8	Oct-18	Jul-18	Oct-18								
Mar-18	18-03	9	Oct-18	Jul-18	Oct-18								
Mar-18	18-03	10	Oct-18	Jul-18	Oct-18								
Public Sat		mal (Care and C	ontrol									
Jun-18	18-04	1	Jan-19										
Jun-18	18-04	2	Jan-19										
Jun-18	18-04	3	Jan-19										
Jun-18	18-04	4	Jan-19										
Jun-18	18-04	5	Jan-19										
Jun-18	18-04	6	Jan-19										
Jun-18	18-04	7	Jan-19										
			FMB - Int	rastructu	re Sales Su	rtax Progi	ram						
Jun-18	18-05	3	closed										
Jun-18	18-05	1	Dec-18										
Jun-18	18-05	2	Dec-18										
			ent - Inter	nal Contro	ls Review								
Sep-18	18-06	1	Dec-18										
Sep-18	18-06	2	Dec-18										
Sep-18	18-06	3	Dec-18										
Sep-18	18-06	4	Dec-18										
Sep-18	18-06	5	Dec-18										
Sep-18	18-06	6	Dec-18										

Exhibit 6: Audit Recommendations Submitted for Audit Committee Consideration as of November 15, 2018

Recommendations for which Final Management Action Has Been Taken Without Resolving the Underlying Condition

15-06 Palm Tran	
Fixed Route Operations	
#1 The Department Director should enforce overtime-scheduling requirements based on seniority order. There was improvement in reducing overtime violations over the first three follow-ups. However, the last two follow-ups have shown deterioration. Management is responsible for developing an action plan to resolve this finding. Management must review its system and amend as necessary to correct the nonconformity and accept the risk on non-implementation. Internal Audit will no longer monitor the condition identified in the audit report for Recommendation #1.	 Audit Report 2/11/15 - Overtime violations identified, not tracked. Follow up #1 - 10/23/15 Overtime errors continue to occur (12) OT errors. Follow up #2 - 3/17/16 Overtime errors continue to occur (9) OT errors. Follow up #3 -6/9/17 Missing required supervisory email documentation for overtime scheduling. (3) OT errors. Follow up #4 -11/20/17 (14) OT errors. Implementation of new controls to be completed in 2018.
	• Follow up #5 - 7/20/18 (18) OT errors. Closed without resolving reported condition.

Recommendations Open Longer Than Two Years

15-06 Palm Tran	
Fixed Route Operations	
Report issued March 2015 containing 13	
recommendations.	
Follow-up #1-October 2015, 5 remain open.	
Follow-up #2-March 2016, 3 remain open.	
Follow-up #3- June 2017, 1 remains open.	
Follow-up #4- December 2017, 1 remains open.	
Follow-up #5- August 2018, Closed.	
#1 The Department Director should enforce overtime-	Status – November 2018
scheduling requirements based on seniority order.	Completed.
	Follow up concluded with 18 OT
	errors identified. No further
	monitoring.

Exhibit 6: Audit Recommendations Submitted for Audit Committee Consideration as of November 15, 2018

Status – May 2018 In process.

New initiatives implemented. 14 overtime violations identified. Next follow up scheduled May 2018.

Status – September 2017 In process.

Changes in process, 3 overtime violations identified; follow up scheduled for October 2017.

Status – March 2017 Follow-up pending. Follow-up scheduled for May 2017

Status - September 2016 Follow-up pending.

New implementation scheduled for December 2016; follow-up scheduled for January 2017.

Status - March 2016 In process.

Based on Palm Tran's payroll record, we found 9 instances where Palm Tran did not schedule overtime correctly for a supervisor or ATU employees according to union contract since August 2015. The Director of Admin. Services indicated the contract violations relating to SEIU overtime have not been eliminated. We cannot consider this recommendation fully implemented. Implementation scheduled for September 2016; follow-up scheduled for October 2016.

Status - September 2015 Follow-up pending.

Exhibit 6: Audit Recommendations Submitted for Audit Committee Consideration as of November 15, 2018

	Status - March 2015 Follow-up pending. Implementation scheduled for September 2015; follow-up scheduled
	for October 2015.
15-17 Office of Small Business Assistance	
Revenue Management	
Report issued September 2015 containing 2	
recommendations.	
Follow-up #1 November 2016. 1 remains open.	
#2 The OSBA Director should ensure the calculations	Status – November 2018
supporting the fee schedule are maintained and reviewed on an annual basis to determine if fee schedule should	In process.
be adjusted based on either changes in the Consumer	Status – May 2018
Price Index or changes in the OSBA cost structure.	In process.
	_
	Status – September 2017
	In process. Internal Auditor to
	discuss with Department Director.
	Status – March 2017
	In process. Internal Auditor to
	discuss with County Administrator.
	Status Cantanhau 2016
	Status – September 2016 Follow-up pending.
	New implementation scheduled for
	August 2016.
	Status - March 2016
	Follow-up pending.
	Status - September 2015
	Future implementation.
	Implementation scheduled for March
	2016; follow-up scheduled for April 2016.

Exhibit 7 - Recommendation Status at November 15, 2018

Audit Report Number, Title and Recommendation(s)	Recommendation Status
15-06 Palm Tran	
Fixed Route Operations	
Report issued March 2015 containing 13	
recommendations.	
Follow-up #1-October 2015, 5 remain open.	
Follow-up #2-March 2016, 3 remain open.	
Follow-up #3- June 2017, 1 remains open.	
Follow-up #4- December 2017, 1 remains	
open.	
Follow-up #5- August 2018, Closed.	St. 1 2010
#1 The Department Director should enforce overtime-scheduling requirements based on	Status – November 2018
seniority order.	Completed.
somothly order.	Follow up concluded with 18 OT errors identified. No further monitoring.
	identified. Two further monitoring.
	Status – May 2018
	In process.
	New initiatives implemented. 14 overtime
	violations identified. Next follow up
	scheduled May 2018.
	Status – September 2017
	In process.
	Changes in process, 3 overtime violations identified; follow up scheduled for October
	2017.
	2017.
	Status – March 2017
	In process.
	Follow-up scheduled for May 2017
	States State 1 2016
	Status - September 2016
	In process. New implementation scheduled for December
	2016; follow-up scheduled for January 2017.
	2010, 10110 Wap selled alor suitary 2017.
	Status - March 2016
	In process.
	• Follow up #2 - Based on Palm Tran's payrol
	record, we found 9 instances where Palm
	Tran did not schedule overtime correctly for
	a supervisor or ATU employees according
	to union contract since August 2015. The
	Director of Admin. Services indicated the

Exhibit 7 - Recommendation Status at November 15, 2018

Exhibit 7 - Recommendation Status at November 15, 2018

Audit Report Number, Title and Recommendation(s)	Recommendation Status
	Status - September 2015 Future implementation. Implementation scheduled for March 2016; follow-up scheduled for April 2016.
17-04 Human Resources	
Customer Service Processes	
Report issued March 2017 containing 5	
recommendations.	
Follow-up #1 – August 6, 2018, 1	
recommendation remains open.	
#1. The Human Resources Director should add	Status – November 2018
the ability to attach documents when	Complete.
submitting an application to the Online Job	
Application System. In the meantime, the	Status – May 2018
inability of the application to generate a	In process.
completed cover sheet should be corrected and	Fieldwork complete, project in review for
the instructions in the e-mail acknowledging	memo distribution.
receipt of the application should include	
directions on how to submit additional	
documents.	Status – September 2017
	Future implementation.
	Follow-up scheduled for October 2017.
	Status at March 31, 2017
	Future implementation.
	Implementation scheduled for August 2017
#2. The Human Resources Director should	Status – November 2018
require T&E raters to use the module in the	Complete.
HRIS system to calculate the total criteria	
points for each applicant.	Status – May 2018
	In process.
	Fieldwork complete, project in review for
	memo distribution.
	Status – September 2017
	Future implementation.
	Follow-up scheduled for October 2017.
	Status at March 31, 2017
	Future implementation
	Implementation scheduled for August 2017.

Exhibit 7 - Recommendation Status at November 15, 2018

Audit Report Number, Title and Recommendation(s)	Recommendation Status
#3. The Human Resources Director should request input controls be implemented to require a selection is made in the Education, Experience, and Veteran Preference sections of the Applicant T&E scoring page.	Status – November 2018 Complete. Status – May 2018 In process. Fieldwork complete, project in review for memo distribution.
	Status – September 2017 Future implementation. Follow-up scheduled for October 2017.
#4 The Human Degenerace Director decade	Status at March 31, 2017 Future implementation. Implementation scheduled for April 2017
#4. The Human Resources Director should have an automated system developed that allows a request to be submitted on-line by the departments and track the progress of the request as the recommendation is approved. This would reduce the time a document is passed between approvers and allow the	Status – November 2018 Complete. Status – May 2018 In process. Fieldwork complete, project in review for memo distribution.
departments to check the progress instead of having to contact the Human Resource Specialist to find out the status of the request.	Status – September 2017 Future implementation. Follow-up scheduled for October 2017.
#5. The Human Resources Director should	Status at March 31, 2017 Future implementation. Implementation scheduled for July 2017 Status – November 2018
have all active and terminated employee personnel files housed in the storage shelves scanned and maintained electronically.	In process. More time needed due to the voluminous and sensitive nature of scanning and storing electronically employee personnel files. Follow-up scheduled for January 2019.
	Status – May 2018 In process. Fieldwork complete, project in review for memo distribution.
	Status – September 2017 Future implementation. Follow-up scheduled for October 2017.

Exhibit 7 - Recommendation Status at November 15, 2018

Audit Report Number, Title and Recommendation(s)	Recommendation Status
	Status at March 31, 2017 Future implementation Implementation scheduled for March 2017
17-05 Planning, Zoning, & Building - Code Enforcement Division	
Customer Service Processes	
Report issued June 2017 containing 15	
recommendations.	
Follow-up #1 February 2018, 7 remain open.	
Follow-up #2 August 31, 2018, 3 remain open.	
#2 Implement corrective actions to minimize	Status – November 2018
delays in the complaint response time, which include, but are not limited to:	Complete.
A system edit or a non-system protocol (or combination of both) to ensure complaints are promptly submitted through the Work-in-Progress queue for assignment.	Status – May 2018 In process. Response times improved but remain outside required time frames. Follow up scheduled for June 2018.
Protocols to ensure the drop-down menu for the CEO field, which is used for assigning	Status – September 2017
complaints, is kept current.	Future implementation. Follow-up scheduled for November 2017.
#6 Communicate and review written PPMs	Status – November 2018
with appropriate Staff.	In process.
	Follow-up scheduled December 2018.
	Status – May 2018
	In process.
	PPMs still in process of being updated. Follow up scheduled for June 2018.
	Status – September 2017 Future implementation.
#10 aD7D gygtom accounts	Follow-up scheduled for November 2017.
#10 ePZB system security user access is	Status – November 2018
reviewed, at least annually, to ensure user access is congruent with job responsibilities and functions; including both security roles	In process. Follow-up scheduled December 2018.
and other added access (i.e. Supervisor	Status May 2019
` 1	Status – May 2018 In process Actions have not been taken to
Authority).	In process. Actions have not been taken to resolve recommendation. Follow up scheduled for June 2018.

Exhibit 7 - Recommendation Status at November 15, 2018

Audit Report Number, Title and Recommendation(s)	Recommendation Status
	Status – September 2017
	Future implementation.
	Follow-up scheduled for November 2017.
#11 Procedures are established for system	Status – November 2018
access control in ePZB (including a protocol to resolve incompatible duties of staff	Complete.
granting/modifying access to the system to	Status – May 2018
themselves).	In process. Actions have not been taken to
	resolve recommendation. Follow up scheduled for June 2018.
	Status – September 2017
	Future implementation.
	Follow-up scheduled for November 2017.
#12 Request to grant/modify security access in the ePZB system is authorized by Division management, documented (manual,	Status – November 2018 Complete.
electronic), and maintained.	Status May 2019
creetionics, and maintained.	Status – May 2018
	In process. Actions have not been taken to
	resolve recommendation. Follow up scheduled for June 2018.
	Status – September 2017 Future implementation.
	Follow-up scheduled for November 2017.
#13 Procedures are established for system	Status – November 2018
access control in ePZB (including a protocol to resolve incompatible duties of staff	Complete.
granting/modifying access to the system to	Status – May 2018
themselves).	In process. Procedures not in place. Follow
	up scheduled for June 2018.
	Status – September 2017
	Future implementation.
#14 The Code For	Follow-up scheduled for November 2017.
#14 The Code Enforcement Division Director	Status – November 2018
should ensure all division PPMs are up-to-date,	In process.
contain clear expectations of established timeframes for responding to complaints, and	Follow-up scheduled December 2018.
staff is made aware of all PPM requirements.	Status – May 2018
•	In process. PPMs still in process of being updated. Follow up scheduled for June 2018.
	ap senedated for suite 2016.

Exhibit 7 - Recommendation Status at November 15, 2018

Audit Report Number, Title and Recommendation(s)	Recommendation Status
	Status – September 2017 Future implementation. Follow-up scheduled for November 2017.
18-01 Facilities Development & Operations Capital Project Management Process	
Report issued December 2017 containing 9 recommendations. Recommendation #9 closed with issuance of report. Follow-up #1 August 6, 2018, 6 remain open.	
#1 The Department Director should ensure that there are adequate and consistently applied procedures to establish and record completion dates as determined by Department personnel.	Status – November 2018 In process. Follow-up scheduled December 2018.
	Status – May 2018 Follow-up pending. Follow-up scheduled for May 2018.
#2 The Department Director should ensure that all project files contain documentation supporting the CID Director's determination as	Status – November 2018 Complete.
to whether liquidated damages are to be assessed and the calculation of liquidated damage amounts when deemed necessary.	Status – May 2018 Follow-up pending. Follow-up scheduled for May 2018.
#3 The Department Director should ensure change order requests are handled expeditiously by staff.	Status – November 2018 Complete.
	Status – May 2018 Follow-up pending. Follow-up scheduled for May 2018
#4 The Department Director should ensure the CID Director documents the allowance and other GMP line reconciliation process in the Project Manual and that appropriate	Status – November 2018 In process. Follow-up scheduled December 2018.
documentation to support the allowance reconciliation process is retained in the project files.	Status – May 2018 Follow-up pending. Follow-up scheduled for May 2018
#5 The Department Director should revise their contracts to comply with current management processes.	Status – November 2018 In process. Follow-up scheduled December 2018.
	Status – May 2018 Follow-up pending.
	Follow-up scheduled for May 2018

Exhibit 7 - Recommendation Status at November 15, 2018

Audit Report Number, Title and Recommendation(s)	Recommendation Status
#6 The Department Director should determine whether the Gordian Group's JOC system supports tracking and recording key project milestones.	Status – November 2018 In process. Follow-up scheduled December 2018. Status – May 2018 Follow-up pending. Follow-up scheduled for May 2018
#7 If the determination in recommendation #6 is negative, the Department Director should ensure CID tracks key project milestone dates in the project management system being provided by the project management consultant. #8 The Department Director should ensure that CID updates the CID Project Manual to include reference to the Gordian Group manual and supplements that manual as necessary.	Status – November 2018 In process. Follow-up scheduled December 2018. Status – May 2018 Follow-up pending. Follow-up scheduled for May 2018 Status – November 2018 In process. Follow-up scheduled December 2018.
	Status – May 2018 Follow-up pending. Follow-up scheduled for May 2018
18-02 Department of Airports Capital Project Management Process	
Report issued December 2017 containing 6 recommendations. Follow-up #1 September 10, 2018. All recommendations cleared.	
#1 The DOA Director should revise existing contract management practices to ensure compliance with the requirements of the CCNA statute. These revised practices should be documented in Departmental policies and procedures and distributed to appropriate staff members. In developing these practices, the DOA Director should consult with the County Attorney's Office to determine an appropriate policy on managing solicitations for groups or packages of projects that will ensure compliance with the CCNA statute.	Status – November 2018 Complete. Status – May 2018 Follow-up pending. Follow-up scheduled for June 2018
#2 The DOA Director should institute procedures that ensure all future Board of County Commissioners agenda items for	Status – November 2018 Complete.

Exhibit 7 - Recommendation Status at November 15, 2018

Audit Report Number, Title and Recommendation(s)	Recommendation Status
contract amendments and modifications include all the information required by the referenced PPM. These procedures should be documented and distributed to appropriate staff for implementation. The Director may need to consult with County Administration regarding any necessary clarifications in existing County policy.	Status – May 2018 Follow-up pending. Follow-up scheduled for June 2018
#3 The DOA Director should develop, document and implement procedures to ensure that payment of consultant pay applications is consistent with: the contractually required deliverables; contractual schedules for deliverables and other services. Also, provisions relating to reimbursements for time and materials, travel and per diem, and other reimbursable expenses established in the consultant agreement should be uniform and consistent across all amendments to the consultant's contract.	Status – November 2018 Complete. Status – May 2018 Follow-up pending. Follow-up scheduled for June 2018
#4 The DOA Director should develop, document and implement procedures to ensure that changes to the consultant's design team are approved by the Department Director and that the approval is documented in the project files.	Status – November 2018 Complete. Status – May 2018 Follow-up pending.
#5 The DOA Director should develop, document and implement procedures to ensure that liquidated damages are imposed when appropriate and that supporting documentation such as the certification of substantial completion is properly and accurately	Follow-up scheduled for June 2018 Status – November 2018 Complete. Status – May 2018 Follow-up pending. Follow-up scheduled for June 2018
#6 The DOA Director should develop, document and implement procedures to ensure that warranty and maintenance documents are received in a timely manner as specified in the contract, and that the receipt is promptly and accurately recorded in the project files.	Status – November 2018 Complete. Status – May 2018 Follow-up pending. Follow-up scheduled for June 2018
18-03 Library Department Information Technology Management Report issued January 2018 containing 11 recommendations. Recommendation #11	

Exhibit 7 - Recommendation Status at November 15, 2018

Audit Report Number, Title and Recommendation(s)	Recommendation Status
closed with issuance of report. Follow-up #1 Initially scheduled for July 2018, rescheduled to October 2018 as implementation not complete.	
#1 The Department Director and the IT Division Director should ensure access at each MDF room location is restricted to those individuals with a job responsibility [not rank and title] that requires access to the room. More specifically, access should be controlled with a separate key to the MDF room, badge access restrictions, key distribution records, and periodic re-keying.	Status – November 2018 In process. Status – May 2018 Future Implementation. Follow-up #1 scheduled for July 2018
#2 The Department Director and the IT Division Director should ensure access to MDF room locations (i.e. badge, key) is reviewed semi-annually for appropriateness and those identified without a need for entry discontinued. This would include an evaluation of badge access records from ESS and a review of current key distribution records.	Status – November 2018 In process. Status – May 2018 Future Implementation. Follow-up #1 scheduled for July 2018
#3 The Department Director and the IT Division Director should ensure policies and procedures (PPMs) for key areas of the operations are in writing and clearly communicated to staff, and are reviewed periodically and updated when necessary. Written PPMs should include, but not limited to, such areas as the PNR function, recovery plan testing, business interruption maintenance, desktop application and update installation protocols, and practices for scheduling and conducting application maintenance.	Status – November 2018 In process. Status – May 2018 Future Implementation. Follow-up #1 scheduled for July 2018
#4 The Department Director and the IT Division Director should ensure IT staff performance is periodically monitored against key expectations outlined and communicated in written PPMs. #5 The Department Director and the IT	Status – November 2018 In process. Status – May 2018 Future Implementation. Follow-up #1 scheduled for July 2018 Status – November 2018
Division Director should assign individual user IDs and passwords where appropriate to senior	In process.

Exhibit 7 - Recommendation Status at November 15, 2018

Audit Report Number, Title and Recommendation(s)	Recommendation Status
staff and Library IT staff, and implement a requirement for Library customer service staff working in public service areas to use the Windows lock feature whenever an active computer terminal is left unattended.	Status – May 2018 Future Implementation. Follow-up #1 scheduled for July 2018
#6 The Department Director and the IT Division Director should develop a formal process that specifies the system and data access required for a new user, and provides for management authorization.	Status – November 2018 In process. Status – May 2018 Future Implementation. Follow-up #1 scheduled for July 2018
#7 The Department Director and the IT Division Director should implement a process to promptly identify and disable and/or delete terminated and transferred employee access from the system.	Status – November 2018 In process. Status – May 2018 Future Implementation. Follow-up #1 scheduled for July 2018
#8 The Department Director and the IT Division Director should establish a schedule to change passwords periodically, at a maximum of 180 calendar days.	Status – November 2018 In process. Status – May 2018 Future Implementation. Follow-up #1 scheduled for July 2018
#9 The Department Director and the IT Division Director should conduct an annual review of current user access rights (both business and technical) to verify access is appropriate and consistent with present job functions and authorized access. Inappropriate access should be identified and disabled promptly.	Status – November 2018 In process. Status – May 2018 Future Implementation. Follow-up #1 scheduled for July 2018
#10 The Department Director and the IT Division Director should document user access roles and associated functionality for the ILS to promote role-based security and to ensure users are granted access that is consistent and appropriate with their job functions.	Status – November 2018 In process. Status – May 2018 Future Implementation. Follow-up #1 scheduled for July 2018
18-04 Public Safety Animal Care and Control Report issued March 2018 containing 7 recommendations. Follow up scheduled for January 2019.	

Exhibit 7 - Recommendation Status at November 15, 2018

Audit Report Number, Title and Recommendation(s)	Recommendation Status
#1 The ACC Director should ensure that all PPMs and SOPs older than five years are reviewed for appropriateness and revised as needed.	Status – November 2018 Future Implementation. Follow up scheduled January 2019.
#2 The ACC Director should establish a process that ensures this review is conducted as needed, with a maximum period between reviews being five years.	Status – November 2018 Future Implementation. Follow up scheduled January 2019.
#3 The ACC Director should develop a Divisional inventory management PPM for medicines, drugs and medical supplies as required by County Policy. The Divisional PPM should include the relevant elements identified in the County Policy.	Status – November 2018 Future Implementation. Follow up scheduled January 2019.
#4 The ACC Director should acquire and implement an automated inventory management system for the management of their inventory of Medical drugs and supplies.	Status – November 2018 Future Implementation. Follow up scheduled January 2019.
#5 The FAS Director should continue the initiated actions to update and revise the Cash Management PPM and to implement the planned controls to address all the control issues identified.	Status – November 2018 Future Implementation. Follow up scheduled January 2019.
#6 The ACC Director should ensure that access to all Chameleon functions, especially restricted ones, be restricted to authorized users only based on the job requirements of each employee. Exception reporting and monitoring should be used in cases where access to restricted functions is not automated.	Status – November 2018 Future Implementation. Follow up scheduled January 2019.
#7 The ACC Director should also institute an annual process to review the system access to the Chameleon system as required by County PPM.	Status – November 2018 Future Implementation. Follow up scheduled January 2019.
18-05 Multiple Department / OFMB Infrastructure Sales Surtax Program Report issued May 2018 containing 3 recommendations. Recommendation #3 closed. Follow up scheduled for December 2018.	
#1 The "Notes" section of the Monthly Infrastructure Sales Tax Project Report should	Status – November 2018 Future Implementation.

Exhibit 7 - Recommendation Status at November 15, 2018

Audit Report Number, Title and Recommendation(s)	Recommendation Status
include a comment indicating how much of the total project budget is currently funded. Information on prior year and future year funding should also be provided.	Follow up scheduled December 2018.
#2 The project to implement an automated interface between Prolog and the accounting system should be given the highest priority for development as this capability should eliminate the duplication of effort in entering the same data in both systems as well as eliminate the timing and reconciliation issues thus resulting in improved efficiency for program administration.	Status – November 2018 Future Implementation. Follow up scheduled December 2018.
#3 The County Administrator should require departments responsible for managing and implementing capital projects to use a project management system with capabilities similar to Prolog to facilitate periodic reporting of all capital projects.	Status – November 2018 Complete. Closed with issuance of report.
18-06 Youth Services Department Internal Controls Review Report issued July 2018 containing 6 recommendations. Follow up scheduled for December 2018.	
#1 The YSD Director should establish standards for monitoring Summer Camp Providers addressing both returning providers and new providers, as well as the number and frequency of monitoring visits of both types of providers to ensure compliance with program requirements.	Status – November 2018 Future Implementation. Follow up scheduled December 2018.
#2 The YSD Director should revise the current Sumer Camp Program PPM to include the standards included in recommendation #1. #3 The YSD Director should revise the current Youth Empowerment Center PPM to include guidelines and directions to ensure that Youth Empowerment Center are being monitored as per contract/agreements.	Status – November 2018 Future Implementation. Follow up scheduled December 2018. Status – November 2018 Future Implementation. Follow up scheduled December 2018.
#4 The YSD Director should ensure that all client services are reviewed by supervisors and documented in the case management system in	Status – November 2018 Future Implementation. Follow up scheduled December 2018.

Exhibit 7 - Recommendation Status at November 15, 2018

Audit Report Number, Title and Recommendation(s)	Recommendation Status
a timely manner.	
#5 The YSD Director should ensure that all	Status – November 2018
client services that are extended are reviewed	Future Implementation.
and approved by supervisors and timely	Follow up scheduled December 2018.
documented in the case management system.	
#6 The YSD Director should revise PPM	Status – November 2018
YSD-RTFC-HRFC-O-002 to include	Future Implementation.
documentary requirements to establish	Follow up scheduled December 2018.
residency.	