Agenda Item #: 4B-2

PALM BEACH COUNTY BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS AGENDA ITEM SUMMARY

Meeting Date: June 15, 2021 []Consent []Regular [X]Public Hea	ring
---	------

Department/Submitted By: COMMISSION ON ETHICS

I. EXECUTIVE BRIEF

Motion and Title: Staff recommends motion to adopt: An Ordinance of the Board of County Commissioners of Palm Beach County, Florida, amending Chapter 2, Article V, Division 8 of the Palm Beach County Code, the Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics Ordinance, as amended; amending section 2-255 (Membership, Qualifications, Terms, Vacancies); amending section 2-256 (Applicability of Code of Ethics Ordinance); amending section 2-257 (Organization); amending section 2-258 (Powers and Duties); amending section 2-258.1 (Extended Jurisdiction by Interagency Agreements); amending section 2-259 (Financial Support For The Commission); amending section 2-260 (Procedure on Complaints Filed); amending section 2-260.1 (Public Hearing Procedures); amending section 2-260.2 (Notification And Referral To Other Authorities); amending section 2-260.3 (Dismissal of Complaints); amending section 2-260.4 (Frivolous or Groundless Complaints); amending section 2-260.8 (Statute of Limitations); amending section 2-260.9 (Advisory Opinion); providing for a Savings Clause; providing for Repeal of Laws in Conflict; providing for Severability; providing for Inclusion in the Code of Laws and Ordinances; providing for Enforcement; providing for Penalties; and providing for an Effective Date.

Summary: The Board of County Commissioners adopted the Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics Ordinance as a countywide Ordinance in May of 2011, in accordance with the County Charter. The Charter amendments, which were approved by the voters in November 2010, also called for the establishment of a review committee to review and recommend proposed changes to the Commission on Ethics Ordinance. This amendment was proposed by the Commission on Ethics and recommended for approval by the ordinance review committee. These amendments would create a removal process for commissioners due to violation of any of the provisions listed in sec. 2-255(e); amend chair and vice-chair terms from two years to one year; provide for payment of advocates needed to present case where Commission on Ethics is seeking sanctions at the current hourly rate established by the county for outside legal services; provide for payment of hearing officers or special magistrates in accordance with the current schedule established by the county for hearing

officers or special magistrates; require hearing officer or special magistrate to conducting final public hearings; and require the Commission on Ethics Commissioners to determine appropriate penalty and render final order if the hearing officer or special magistrate finds a violation has been committed. **Countywide** (HJF)

Background and Policy Issues: The Palm Beach County Code of Ethics applies to all county and municipal officials and employees, lobbyists, their principals and employers, and vendors. These amendments impact how a person accused of a violation of the Code of Ethics is tried. All final public hearings will be conducted by a hearing officer, and if found in violation, will be sent to the Commission on Ethics to make a determination of any sanctions to be assessed against Respondent, and to file a final order in the matter.

Attachment: 1. Proposed Commission on Ethics Ordinance Amendments

Recommended by:

Mark E. Bannon, Executive Director

Approved by:

Todd Bonlarron, Assistant County Administrator

Date

II. FISCAL IMPACT ANALYSIS

A.	Five Year Summary of Fiscal Impact:					
	Fiscal Years	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025
Opera Extern Progra	al Expenditures ating Costs nal Revenues am Income (County) d Match (County)					
NET	ΓFISCAL IMPACT		-		***************************************	
	DDITIONAL FTE SITIONS (Cumulative))				
Is Iter	n Included in Current	Budget?	Yes	No		
Budge	et Account No.: Fund	Dep	artment	Unit	Object _	
	Repo	rting Catego	ory			
B.	Recommended Soul	rces of Fund	s/Summary o	f Fiscal Impac	et:	
C.	Departmental Fiscal	Review:				
		III. <u>REV</u>	IEW COMME	<u>NTS</u>		•
Α.	OFMB Fiscal and/or OFMB	Contract De 512621 み 520.2	130	nd Control Col	J. Jawloo	45/26/2 ntral
B.	Legal Sufficiency: Howard J. Falcon, II Chief Assistant Cou		<u>/21</u>			
C.	Other Department R	deview:				,
	Department [Director				

THIS SUMMARY IS NOT TO BE USED AS A BASIS FOR PAYMENT.

ORDINANCE NO 2021 -

4

ORDINANCE OF THE **BOARD** OF COUNTY ANCOMMISSIONERS OF PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, AMENDING CHAPTER 2, ARTICLE V, DIVISION 8 OF THE PALM BEACH COUNTY CODE, THE PALM BEACH COUNTY COMMISSION ON ETHICS ORDINANCE, AS AMENDED; AMENDING **SECTION** 2-255 (MEMBERSHIP QUALIFICATIONS, TERMS, **VACANCIES)**; **AMENDING** SECTION 2-256 (APPLICABILITY OF CODE OF ETHICS ORDINANCE); SECTION **AMENDING** (ORGANIZATION); AMENDING SECTION 2-258 (POWERS AND DUTIES); AMENDING SECTION 2-258.1 (EXTENDED JURISDICTION \mathbf{BY} INTERAGENCY AGREEMENTS); AMENDING SECTION 2-259 (FINANCIAL SUPPORT FOR THE COMMISSION); AMENDING **SECTION** (PROCEDURE ON COMPLAINTS FILED); **AMENDING SECTION** 2-260.1 (PUBLIC HEARING PROCEDURES); (NOTIFICATION AMENDING **SECTION** 2-260.2 AND REFERRAL TO **AUTHORITIES)**; OTHER **AMENDING** SECTION 2-260.3 (DISMISSAL OF COMPLAINTS); (FRIVOLOUS AMENDING **SECTION** 2-260.4 GROUNDLESS COMPLAINTS); AMENDING SECTION 2-260.8 (STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS); AMENDING SECTION 2-260.9 (ADVISORY OPINION); PROVIDING FOR A SAVINGS CLAUSE; **PROVIDING FOR** REPEAL OF CONFLICT; PROVIDING FOR SEVERABILITY; PROVIDING **INCLUSION** THE IN CODE **ORDINANCES**; **PROVIDING** FOR **ENFORCEMENT**; PROVIDING FOR PENALTIES; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

33 34 35

36

37

38

39

40

41

44

48

32

WHEREAS, based on a referendum on November 2, 2010, concerning proposed amendments to the Palm Beach County Charter, a majority of voters in the County and in every municipality in Palm Beach County elected to require the Board of County Commissioners to adopt an ordinance to establish a countywide Commission on Ethics with the authority to review, interpret, render advisory opinions and to enforce the countywide Palm Beach County Code of Ethics and to provide ethics training for the benefit of local governments, citizens groups and the general public; and

WHEREAS, the Palm Beach County Board of County Commissioners adopted the Palm 42

Beach County Commission on Ethics Ordinance, Ordinance 2011-10 on May 17, 2011 and adopted 43

amendments in Ordinance 2015-032 on September 22, 2015;

45 WHEREAS, the Board of County Commissioners finds that the amendments set forth

herein advances the purposes and intent of the Palm Beach County Charter amendments approved 46

47 by the electorate on November 2, 2010; and

WHEREAS, the Board of County Commissioners of Palm Beach County, pursuant to its

50	the Palm Beach County Charter, hereby amends the Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics
51	Ordinance; and
52	WHEREAS, the Board of County Commissioners has conducted a duly noticed public
53	hearing to consider these amendments as required by law.
54	NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT ORDAINED BY THE BOARD OF COUNTY
55	COMMISSIONERS OF PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, that:
56	Part 1. Section 2-255 is amended as follows:
57	Section 2-255. Membership, qualifications, terms, vacancies.
58	(a) Composition and appointment. The commission on ethics shall be composed of five (5)
59	members. The members of the commission on ethics shall be appointed as follows:
60	(1) The president of the county association of chiefs of police shall be requested to appoint
61	a former law enforcement official with experience in investigating white collar crime or
62	public corruption.
63	(2) The president of the Hispanic Bar Association of Palm Beach County, in conjunction
64	with the president of the F. Malcolm Cunningham, Sr. Bar Association and the president
65	of the county bar association Palm Beach County Bar Association, shall be requested to
66	appoint an attorney with experience in ethics regulation of public officials and employees.
67	(3) The president of Florida Atlantic University (FAU) shall be requested to appoint a
68	faculty member, who teaches at an accredited institution of higher education with a campus
69	located within the county and who has taught a course in professional legal ethics or has
70	published or performed services in the field of professional legal ethics.
71	(4) The president of the Palm Beach Echapter of the Florida Institute of CPAs shall be
72	requested to appoint a single member who possesses at least five (5) years of experience
73	as a certified public accountant (CPA) with forensic auditing and/or government
74	accounting or government auditing audit experience.
75	(5) The board of directors of the Palm Beach County League of Cities, Inc. shall be
76	requested to appoint a person who has served as a former elected official or a former
77	manager, chief administrative officer, or chief executive officer for a governmental entity
78	in the county.
79	All appointing officers or entities identified in subsections (a)(1) through (5) shall in good faith

authority under Florida Constitution, Article VIII, Section 1 (g), Section 125.01, Florida Statutes,

endeavor to appoint members of the commission on ethics within forty-five (45) days of the
effective date of the ordinance from which this division is derived. Each appointing entity shall
promptly provide notice of each appointment to the executive director of the commission on ethics,
inspector general, and the county administrator.

- (b) Additional qualifications. Each member of the commission on ethics shall be of outstanding reputation for integrity, responsibility and commitment to serving the community. The members of the commission on ethics should be Appointing entities should consider appointments to the commission on ethics that are representative of the community-at-large and should reflect the racial, gender, and ethnic make-up of the community. Before entering upon the duties of office, each appointee on the commission on ethics shall take the prescribed oath of office pursuant to Florida Constitution, Art. II §5(b). Members of the commission on ethics shall serve without compensation.
- 92 ***

80

81

82

83

84

85

86

87

88

89

90

- 93 (e) Additional requirements. No individual, while a member of the commission on ethics, shall:
- 94 ***
- 95 (3) Actively participate in or contribute to any political action committee, or to any 96 campaign for state or local <u>elective</u> office or for any U.S. Congressional or Senate office 97 serving the State of Florida;
- 98 ***
- 99 (f) Removal process. If a violation of any of the enumerated requirements in subsection (e) herein 100 and is substantiated, the commissioner in question, the appointing entity, and the other 101 commissioners shall be notified. The commissioner may resign by providing notification to the 102 executive director in writing, or the appointing entity may remove the commissioner from office 103 by providing notification to the executive director in writing. If the commissioner does not resign 104 or the appointing entity does not remove the commissioner from office, the executive director shall 105 place the matter on the next agenda for the discussion. A commissioner can be removed from 106 office by the commission upon a majority vote of the remaining commissioners.
- 107 Part 2. Section 2-256 is amended as follows:
- 108 Section 2-256 Applicability of code of ethics ordinance.
- The countywide code of ethics ordinance shall be applicable to all persons and/or entities within the jurisdiction of said ordinance and shall apply to the members and staff of the commission on

- 111 ethics.
- 112 Part 3. Section 2-257 is amended as follows:
- 113 Section 2-257 Organization.
- 114 (a) The commission on ethics shall elect one (1) of its voting members as chairperson and one (1)
- of its voting members as vice chairperson who shall serve a one (1) year term of two (2) years. No
- 116 chairperson shall be permitted to serve two (2) consecutive terms as chairperson in the same
- 117 position. No vice chairperson shall be permitted to serve two (2) consecutive terms as vice
- 118 chairperson.
- 119 (b) The commission on ethics shall adopt bylaws and rules of procedure which that are consistent
- 120 with the provisions of this division and rules and regulations for the commission on ethics'
- governance. The commission on ethics shall hold regular meetings in accordance with the bylaws
- of the commission and may hold such other meetings as it deems necessary.
- 123 (c) All meetings of the commission on ethics that are not conducted in executive session as
- 124 permitted by law shall be public, and written minutes of the proceedings thereof shall be
- maintained by the commission on ethics minutes department of the clerk of courts. All matters
- heard by the commission on ethics in executive session shall be audio recorded or audio/video
- 127 recorded and made available to the public upon the conclusion of the matter. All actions taken at
- the meetings of the commission on ethics shall be promptly and properly recorded. Copies of all
- minutes, resolutions, decisions, or advisory opinions of the commission on ethics shall be
- published to the website of the commission on ethics forwarded to the clerk to the board of county
- 131 commissioners no later than thirty (30) days subsequent to any meeting of the commission on
- 132 ethics.
- 133 (d) The commission on ethics shall be empowered to appoint an executive director and to remove
- such appointee at will. The commission on ethics shall utilize a competitive selection process when
- 135 selecting an executive director. The commission on ethics in consultation with county
- administration shall fix the executive director's salary, subject to ultimate budget approval by the
- board of county commissioners. The executive director shall be empowered to appoint, remove,
- and suspend employees or agents of the commission on ethics, subject to ultimate budget approval
- by the board of county commissioners. The executive director shall be further empowered to adopt
- personnel and management policies consistent with like policies in place for county personnel.
- 141 Part 4. Section 2-258 is amended as follows:

- 142 Section 2-258 Powers and duties.
- 143 ****
- 144 (b) As set forth in the Office of Inspector General, Palm Beach County, Florida Ordinance, the
- 145 commission on ethics shall serve along with one (1) delegate each from the state attorney's office
- and public defender's office for the Fifteenth Judicial Circuit as the inspector general committee.
- 147 The inspector general committee shall be authorized to select the inspector general to determine
- 148 whether or not to renew the term of an inspector general, and to participate in the removal of the
- inspector general as set forth in greater detail in the Office of Inspector General, Palm Beach
- 150 County, Florida Ordinance.
- 151 ***

161

162

163

164

165

166

167

168

169

170

- 152 (d) The commission on ethics shall develop and deliver ethics training and outreach programs for
- 153 the benefit of county and municipal employees and officials, county and municipal vendors,
- 154 nonprofit corporations other public or private entities representing residents of the county or any
- 155 <u>municipality</u>, and other entities that do business with or are regulated by the county or the
- municipalities located within the county. The commission on ethics may recommend that the board
- enter into agreements with other entities to provide such training and outreach programs to be
- administered by the commission on ethics.
- 159 Part 5. Section 2-258.1 is amended as follows:
- 160 Section 2-258.1 Extended jurisdiction by interagency agreements.
 - It is anticipated that taxing districts and other public officials and entities will recognize and desire to benefit from the services of the commission on ethics. The commission on ethics may additionally be empowered to review, interpret, render advisory opinions, and enforce similar rules or regulations duly adopted by any commission, bureau, district, or other governmental entity located in the county, pursuant to agreements or memoranda of understanding between the commission on ethics and said entity. The memorandum of understanding or agreement shall include a provision for fees to be paid to the commission on ethics from the public entity in exchange for such benefits at a rate established by the commission on ethics. All fees paid under any such agreement shall be used solely to fund the operations of the commission on ethics and its staff. Any such agreement or memorandum of understanding is subject to final approval of the board of county commissioners, but such approval shall not be unreasonably withheld.
- 172 Part 6. Section 2-259 is amended as follows:

Section 2-259 – Financial support for the commission

173

- 174 (a) The commission on ethics shall establish a fiscal year that which coincides with that of the 175 county. Pursuant to its annual budget process, the county shall provide sufficient financial support for the commission on ethics to fulfill its duties as set forth in this division. In consultation with 176 177 the county office of financial management and budget, The commission on ethics shall timely 178 submit to the board of county commissioners a budget request including a reasonable estimate of 179 operating and capital expenditures, which request shall not be implemented until approved by the 180 board of county commissioners. 181 (b) The commission on ethics budget request shall be prepared by the county office of financial 182 management and budget in consultation with the commission on ethics' executive director and 183 staff on official county budget forms in a format prescribed by the county office of financial 184 management and budget, shall be reviewed in a manner similar to that in which of other county 185 departments are reviewed, and shall be incorporated in the proposed budget and timely submitted 186 to the board of county commissioners each year. Nothing contained herein shall be construed to 187 prohibit the commission on ethics from submitting to the board of county commissioners' 188 supplemental budget requests to the board of county commissioners which, if approved, shall 189 constitute amendments to the county budget. 190 (c) In addition to budgetary appropriations made by the county, the board of county 191 commissioners, may, for the benefit of the commission on ethics, accept grants, contributions or 192 appropriations from the federal government, state government, any municipality within the county, 193 or any academic institution or nonprofit entity which that has not entered into a contract or transacted business with the county or any governmental entity subject to the provisions of this 194 195 ordinance. The commission on ethics may accept grants, contributions or appropriations from an 196 academic institution or nonprofit entity which that has entered into a contract or transacted business with the county if the board of county commissioners, by resolution, approves the grant, 197 198 contribution, or appropriation. No other grants, contributions, or appropriations may be accepted
 - 200 Part 7. Section 2-260 is amended as follows:

by the commission on ethics.

- 201 Section 2-260 Procedure on Complaints filed.
- 202 (a) Filing of complaints.

199

203 (1) Any person may file a complaint with the commission on ethics.

204 (2) The Inspector General, Executive Director executive director of the commission on ethics.

205 ethics Commission on Ethics, the inspector general, or the State Attorney state attorney may file a complaint with the commission on ethics.

(b) Legal sufficiency of complaints.

208 ***

207

209

210

211

213

214

216

217

218

219

220

221

222

223

224

225

226

227

228

229

230

231

232

233

234

(2) In order to be found legally sufficient, complaints filed by the Inspector General,

Executive Director Commission Ethics executive director of the commission on ethics,

the inspector general, or the State Attorney state attorney must:

212 ***

Upon a finding of legal sufficiency by the executive director <u>or general counsel</u>, the commission on ethics <u>staff</u> shall initiate a preliminary investigation.

215 ***

- (d) Preliminary investigation and public hearing. A preliminary investigation shall be undertaken by the commission on ethics of each legally sufficient complaint over which the commission on ethics has jurisdiction to determine whether there is probable cause to believe that a violation has occurred. If, upon completion of the preliminary investigation, the commission on ethics finds no probable cause to believe that a violation has been committed, the commission on ethics shall dismiss the complaint with the issuance of a report to the complainant and the respondent. If the commission on ethics finds from the preliminary investigation probable cause to believe that a violation has been committed, it shall set the matter for a public hearing and notify complainant and respondent via certified mail, hand delivery, or courier. The commission on ethics may use telephone or electronic mail as a secondary means of notice. The commission on ethics or the hearing officer conducting the public hearing may order commission staff to conduct such further investigation as it deems necessary, and may enter into such stipulations and settlements as it finds to be just and in the best interest of the citizens of the county. The public hearing provided for in this section shall be held within one hundred twenty (120) days of the probable cause determination unless extended by the commission on ethics or the hearing officer conducting the public hearing-for good cause based on the request of a party or on its own initiative.
- (e) **Investigations**. Investigations shall be conducted by commission on ethics staff or by any other person or agency so designated by the commission on ethics under the supervision of the

executive director-and/or the inspector general. Investigations shall be limited to the allegations of the complaint, but shall include an investigation of all facts and persons materially related to the complaint at issue. Where other potential violations of any ordinance within the commission on ethics' jurisdiction are found during an investigation of all facts and persons materially related to the complaint at issue, the additional violations may be added by the executive director by amendment of the complaint, or may be filed as a new complaint. Subsequent to the filing of a complaint and notice to the respondent, the commission on ethics has an ongoing duty to disclose to the respondent any and all additional documents, statements of witnesses and other evidence, not otherwise subject by statute to nondisclosure, obtained by the commission pursuant to the ongoing investigation of a complaint.

(f) Counsel.

- (1) Counsel to commission on ethics. The executive director and general counsel of the commission on ethics shall act as select counsel to advise the commission on ethics.
- (2) Advocate. The commission on ethics shall retain legal counsel to serve as the advocate. The advocate shall prosecute all probable cause hearings eases-before the commission on ethics or-where commission on ethics staff is recommending a finding of probable cause, and all final hearings before the hearing officer. The executive director or general counsel may serve as advocate, provided the execute director he or she is a member of the Florida Bar in good standing, and provided he or she serves as advocate only during proceedings before the commission on ethics or hearing officer where he or she is presenting a stipulation of settlement, is recommending a finding of no probable cause, or is recommending a dismissal. The advocate may serve on a volunteer basis.
- (3)Counsel to the commission on ethics, the advocate, or both may serve on a volunteer basis.
- (<u>3</u>-<u>4</u>-) Respondent. The respondent may appear on his or her own behalf or may be represented by a lawyer. All notices and communications to a respondent represented by a lawyer shall be made through respondent's lawyer.

261 ***

(h) General power of subpoena. The commission on ethics shall be empowered to subpoena and investigate. In the case of a refusal to obey a request for documents or for an interview during an investigation, the commission on ethics may subpoena relevant witnesses and compel their attendance and testimony, administer oaths and affirmations, take evidence, and require by

subpoena the production of any books, papers, records, or other relevant items. The commission on ethics may delegate to its staff the authority to administer oaths and affirmations. In the case of a refusal to obey a subpoena issued to any person, the commission on ethics may make application to any circuit court of this state, which shall have jurisdiction to order the witness to appear before the commission on ethics and to produce evidence, if so ordered, or to give testimony relevant to the matter in question. Any person who fails to obey the order may be punished in a court of law. Seventy-two (72) hours prior to serving a subpoena, the executive director shall provide written notice to the state attorney and the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of Florida. The commission on ethics shall not interfere with any ongoing criminal investigation or prosecution of the state attorney or the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of Florida. When the state attorney or the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of Florida has explicitly notified the commission on ethics in writing that the commission's investigation is interfering with an he or she is conducting an ongoing criminal investigation or prosecution, and he or she believes the commission's investigation or other procedures may interfere with the ongoing investigation or prosecution, the commission on ethics shall suspend service of subpoena, examination of witnesses, or other investigative activities as set forth in the notice until such time as the ongoing investigation or prosecution is completed. During this period, the two-year statute of limitations under Section 2-260.8 of the Commission on Ethics Ordinance shall be tolled until the completion of the ongoing investigation or prosecution. During the tolled period, the commission on ethics staff shall contact the prosecuting authority every 90 days to determine the status of the investigation or prosecution until the completion of the ongoing investigation or prosecution. (i) The Florida rules of civil procedure shall apply to discovery. The hearing officer may order

266

267

268

269

270

271

272

273

274

275

276

277

278

279

280

281

282

283

284

285

286

287

290

291

292

293

294

295

- 288 289 any additional discovery that they deem fair and just.
 - (i) Subpoenas for discovery. At any time after the commission on ethics orders a public hearing of the matter, the commission on ethics or hearing officer conducting the public hearing may issue subpoenas, as provided in subsection (h), to effect discovery upon the written request of respondent or advocate. The requesting person shall give-submit to the commission on ethics staff, for dissemination to the hearing officer, a list of all witnesses he or she wishes to have deposed. The list shall contain the name and address of each witness he or she wishes to have deposed and shall describe with particularity those documents or other

297	items that the person wishes to have the witness produce pursuant to a subpoena duces tecum.
298	The chairperson or a member of the commission on ethics designated by the chairperson, or
299	the hearing officer may issue appropriate orders to effectuate the purposes of discovery and to
300	prevent delay.
301	(j)(k) Subpoenas for public hearing. The respondent and the advocate shall submit to the
302	executive director the commission on ethics staff, for dissemination to the hearing officer, a list
303	of all witnesses he or she wishes to have subpoenaed to attend the hearing. The lists shall contain
304	the correct names and addresses of the witnesses and shall describe with particularity those
305	documents or other items that he or she wishes to have the witness bring to the hearing pursuant
306	to subpoena duces tecum. Subpoenas shall be issued as provided in subsection (h).
307	(k) (l) Motions.
308	* * *
309	(2) The original of a written motion shall be filed with the commission on ethics staff and a
310	copy served on all parties or their attorneys. The commission on ethics staff shall send a
311	copy of the motion to the chairperson or the hearing officer conducting the public hearing.
312	(3) The chairperson, or a member of the commission on ethics designated by the chairperson,
313	or the hearing officer conducting the public hearing shall conduct such proceedings and
314	make such orders as are deemed necessary to dispose of issues raised by motions, but is not
315	required to hold a hearing on the motion in order to rule upon it.
316	(4) Every written motion may be accompanied by, or included in, a written memorandum stating
317	the grounds upon which the motion is based. Other parties to a proceeding may, within
318	seven (7) days of service of a written motion, file written memoranda in opposition. The
319	hearing officer may accept additional information from the parties that is deemed relevant.
320	The hearing officer may impose limitations that are deemed appropriate.
321	(1)(m) Prehearing conferences. The chairperson, a member of the commission on ethics
322	designated by the chairperson, or the hearing officer conducting the public hearing may
323	conduct one (1) or more prehearing conferences for the purpose of hearing arguments on
324	pending motions, clarifying and simplifying issues, discussing the possibilities of settlement

of the issues, examining exhibits and documents, exchanging names and addresses of

(m) (n) Exchange of witness lists. Unless otherwise ordered by the chairperson, a member of the

witnesses, and resolving other procedural matters.

297

325

326

eommission on ethics designated by the chairperson, or the hearing officer conducting the public hearing as a result of a prehearing conference, the advocate and the respondent(s) or counsel for respondent(s) shall exchange the names and addresses of witnesses at least ten (10) days prior to the public hearing, with a copy being provided to the chairperson hearing officer. Names and addresses of witnesses discovered subsequently shall be disclosed to the other party or parties and to the chairperson-hearing officer as soon as possible. Failure to disclose the name and address of a witness may result in the exclusion of the witness's testimony, according to the rule applied in civil judicial proceedings.

Part 8. Section 2-260.1 is amended as follows:

Section 2-260.1 – Public hearing procedures.

- (a) Right to public hearing. After finding of probable cause, a respondent is entitled to a public hearing on the complaint. The respondent may elect to have the hearing shall be conducted by the commission on ethics or by a hearing officer selected from a list of hearing officers or special magistrates established by Palm Beach County, who have received training in the code of ethics by commission on ethics staff. Payment for hearings officers conducting hearings for the commission on ethics shall be paid by the county in accordance with the current schedule established by the county for hearing officers or special magistrates at the time of the assignment of the hearing officer to the matter to be heard, established by the Palm Beach County Bar Association, the F. Malcolm Cunningham, Sr. Bar Association, and the Hispanic Bar Association of Palm Beach County. The associations will strive to reflect the racial, general and ethnic make up of the community in creating and maintaining the list. The list of hearing officers shall contain no more than ten (10) names of individuals who shall serve on a rotating basis. Hearing officers shall serve without compensation. Hearing officers shall be appointed for a term of two (2) years. In order to be eligible for inclusion on the list, hearing officers for the commission on ethics shall have the following minimum qualifications:
 - (1) Be a member, in good standing of the Florida Bar for at least the preceding five years; and
 - (2) Be experienced-competent in matters of governmental ethics, including the current version of the Palm Beach County Code of Ethics, related ordinances, and rules, practices and advisory opinions of the Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics; and
 - (3) Attorneys with prior judicial experience or experience as a hearing officer, <u>magistrate</u>, mediator or special master shall be deemed uniquely qualified; and

359	(4) Be of outstanding reputation for integrity, responsibility, and commitment to serving the
360	community; and
361	(5) No individual, while a hearing officer for the commission on ethics shall:
362	(a) Hold or campaign for any elective political office;
363	(b) Hold office in any political party or political committee;
364	(c) Actively participate in or contribute to any political action committee, or to any
365	campaign for state or local <u>elected</u> office or for any U.S. Congressional or Senate office
366	serving the State of Florida;
367	(d) Be employed by Palm Beach County, any municipality within the county, or any other
368	governmental entity subject to the authority of the commission on ethics or the inspector
369	general, other than as a county hearing officer or special magistrate;
370	(e) Allow his or her name to be used by a campaign in support of or against any candidate
371	for political office or any referendum or other ballot question. Nothing herein shall
372	preclude a hearing officer from signing a petition in support of or against any
373	referendum or other ballot question.
374	(6) Hearing Oofficers shall be subject to the Palm Beach County Code of Ethics in the same
375	manner as an individual serving as a Palm Beach County advisory board member.
376	(b) Presentation of the case. The advocate shall present his or her case first. Respondent may
377	then present his or her case. Rebuttal evidence may be permitted in at the discretion of the
378	commission on ethics or hearing officer.
379	***
380	(d) Evidence.
381	***
382	(4) The hearing shall not be conducted according to technical rules relating to evidence and
383	witnesses. Any relevant evidence may be admitted. Hearsay evidence may be used to
384	supplement or explain other evidence, but shall not be sufficient itself to support a
385	finding. The rules of privilege shall be effective to the same extent that they are now
386	recognized in civil actions or hereafter may be recognized in civil actions. Irrelevant and

unduly repetitious evidence shall be excluded. The commission on ethics or hearing

officer shall not allow the introduction into evidence of an affidavit of a person when

that person can be called to testify; this shall not preclude the admission of a deposition

387

388

of such a person, however, for any reason, permissible in a court of law under the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure.

- (e) Transcript of proceedings. The proceedings shall be recorded by recording instruments or by a court reporter. Respondent may, at his or her own expense, provide a court reporter or additional recording instruments. The commission on ethics may provide a court reporter to any proceeding conducted by the commission or a hearing officer. No transcript of the proceedings shall be prepared unless requested by the commission on ethics, the hearing officer conducting the public hearing, or by the respondent. If the respondent requests that a transcript be prepared by a court reporter, the respondent shall pay the expense of transcription. If the Respondent requests that the commission on ethics prepare a transcript from recording instruments and the commission on ethics grants such request, the respondent shall pay the commission on ethics the actual cost of transcription. If a court reporter records the proceedings, the court reporter's transcript shall be the official transcript.
- (f) *Proposed public report*. After the conclusion of the hearing, the respondent and the advocate may present written proposed public reports, within a time designated by the chairperson, a member of the commission on ethics designated by the chairperson, or the hearing officer conducting the public hearing. If a proposed public report is filed by the respondent or the advocate, each proposed finding in the proposal that is rejected shall be accompanied by a statement summarizing the reasons for rejection.

409 ****

(h) Public reportorder imposing penalty. Upon completion of any hearing initiated under this subsection, the commission on ethics or hearing officer shall make a finding and public report as to whether any provision within its jurisdiction has been violated. If the commission on ethics or hearing officer finds, by clear and convincing evidence, based upon competent substantial evidence in the record, that a violation has been committed, the commission on ethics or hearing officer shall issue an order imposing the appropriate penalty as provided in the ordinance being enforced: the hearing officer shall determine whether the violation was intentional or unintentional and include that determination in the public report. The public report and final order shall include a determination as to whether the violation was intentional or unintentional. The commission on ethics or hearing officer shall, within ninety (90) days of the final hearing twelve (12) months of the filing of a complaint, render the public report and

submit it to the commission on ethics unless extended by the hearing officer for good cause. a
final order disposing of said complaint unless extended by the commission or hearing officer
for good cause. If a person fails to comply with an order issued by the commission on ethics
or hearing officer, the commission on ethics on its own behalf or on behalf of the hearing
officer may make application to any circuit court of this state which shall have jurisdiction to
order the violator to comply with the order of the commission on ethics or hearing officer. Any
violator who fails to obey the order may be punished by the court.

(i) Order Imposing Penalty. If the hearing officer finds that a violation has been committed, the commission on ethics shall hold a hearing to determine an appropriate penalty and render a final order imposing the appropriate penalty as provided in the ordinance being enforced and disposing of said compliant. The hearing provided for in this subsection shall be held within ninety (90) days of the issuance of the public report by the hearing officer, unless extended by the commission on ethics for good cause based on the request of a party or on its own initiative. If a person fails to comply with an order issued by the commission on ethics, the commission on its own behalf may make application to any circuit court of this state, which shall have jurisdiction to order the violator to comply with the order of the commission on ethics. Any violator who fails to obey the order may be punished by the court.

Part 9. Section 2-260.2 is amended as follows:

439 Section 2-260.2 – Notification and referral to other authorities.

As provided for by ordinance within its jurisdiction, the commission on ethics or hearing officer conducting the public hearing shall may refer a matter to the state attorney or any other appropriate official or agency having authority to initiate prosecution when deemed appropriate. The state attorney or other appropriate agency may decline prosecution or enforcement of any matter referred under this divisionand refer the matter back to the commission on ethics or hearing officer. The commission on ethics shall notify the State of Florida Commission on Ethics, the state attorney, the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of Florida, and other appropriate law enforcement agencies within ten (10) days of a finding of no probable cause or of a final order disposing of a complaint.

- 449 Part 10. Section 2-260.3 is amended as follows:
- 450 Section 2-260.3 Dismissal of complaints.
- Notwithstanding any other provisions of this division, the commission on ethics or hearing officer

conducting the public hearing may, at its discretion:

- (a) dismiss any complaint at any stage of disposition should it determine that the public interest would not be served by proceeding further, or
- (b) dismiss any complaint at any stage of disposition and issue a letter of instruction to the respondent when it appears that the alleged violation was inadvertent, unintentional or insubstantial.

In the event the commission on ethics or hearing officer dismisses a complaint as provided in this subsection, the commission on ethics or hearing officer shall issue a public report and final order stating with particularity its reasons for the dismissal. The commission on ethics or hearing officer conducting the public hearing may, at the request of the state attorney or any other law enforcement agency, stay an ongoing proceeding. The commission on ethics or hearing officer shall not interfere with any ongoing criminal investigation of the state attorney or the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of Florida.

Part 11. Section 2-260.4 is amended as follows:

Section 2-260.4 – Frivolous or groundless complaints.

In any case in which the commission on ethics or hearing officer conducting the public hearing determines that the complaining party filed a frivolous or groundless complaint as defined in Florida Statutes, §57.105, or a complaint with malicious intent and with the knowledge that the complaint contains one or more false allegations, or with reckless disregard for whether the complaint contains material false allegations, the commission on ethics or the hearing officer shall order the complaining party to pay any costs and attorney's fees incurred by the commission on ethics and/or the alleged violator. The determination by the commission on ethics or hearing officer regarding whether a complaint is frivolous or groundless shall be deemed conclusive.

475 ****

476 Part 12. Section 2-260.8 is amended as follows:

Section 2-260.8 – Statute of limitations.

(a) No action may be taken on a complaint filed more than two (2) years after the violation is alleged to have occurred unless a person, by fraud or other device, prevents discovery of the violation. Where the allegations are the subject of a personnel proceeding or where the complainant is required to exhaust his or her administrative remedies prior to filing a complaint, the statute of limitations shall be tolled until the termination of said personnel

	proceeding or the exhaustion of administrative remedies. As provided in Section 2-260(h),
	where the commission on ethics has suspended investigative activities after the state
	attorney or the U.S. Attorney for the Southern District of Florida has notified the
	commission on ethics that the commission's investigation may interfere with an ongoing
	criminal investigation or prosecution, the statute of limitations shall be tolled until the
	completion of the ongoing investigation or prosecution.
(b) Notwithstanding any limitation of actions under subsection (a), a prosecution for willfu

- (b) Notwithstanding any limitation of actions under subsection (a), a prosecution for willful violations referred to the State Attorney pursuant to Code of Ethics § 2-448(d) may be commenced at any time when the respondent is in public office or employment, within two (2) years from the time the respondent leaves public office or employment, or within two (2) years of the offense, whichever time is greater.
- Part 13. Section 2-260.9 is amended as follows:

495 Section 2-260.9 – Advisory opinion.

Any person within the jurisdiction of the commission on ethics, when in doubt about the applicability or interpretation of any provision within the commission on ethics' jurisdiction to himself or herself in a particular context, may submit in writing the facts of the situation to the commission on ethics with a request for an advisory opinion to establish the standard of public duty, if any. A person requesting an advisory opinion may withdraw the request at any time up to ten (10) days before the commission on ethics convenes a public meeting to consider the request. An advisory opinion shall be rendered by the commission on ethics on a timely basis, and each such opinion shall be numbered, dated and published.

Part 14. Savings Clause.

All complaints, investigations, advisory opinions, recommended orders, final orders, requests for advisory opinions, hearing processes, and all other functions of the Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics, initiated or completed pursuant to Ordinances 2011-10, 2011-11, or 2011-39, as may be amended, shall remain in full force and effect.

Part 15. Repeal of Laws in Conflict.

All local laws and ordinances in conflict with any provisions of this Ordinance are hereby repealed to the extent of such conflict.

Part 16. Severability.

If any section, paragraph, sentence, clause, phrase, or word of this Ordinance is for any

514	reason held by the Court to be unconstitutional, inoperative, or void, such holding shall not affect		
515	the remainder of this Ordinance.		
516	Part 17. Inclusion in the Code of Laws and Ordinances.		
517	The provisions of this Ordinance shall become and be made a part of the Code of Laws and		
518	Ordinances of Palm Beach County, Florida.	The sections of this Ordinance may be renumbered	
519	or re-lettered to accomplish such, and the word "ordinance" may be changed to "section," "article,"		
520	or other appropriate word.		
521	Part 18. Enforcement.		
522	This Ordinance is enforceable by all means provided by law. Additionally, the County		
523	may choose to enforce this Ordinance by seeking injunctive relief in the Circuit Court of Palm		
524	Beach County.		
525	Part 19. Penalty.		
526	Any violation of any portion of this Ordinance shall be punishable as provided by law.		
527	Part 20. Effective Date.		
528	The provisions of this Ordinance shall become effective on July 1, 2021.		
529	APPROVED AND ADOPTED by	the Board of County Commissioners of Palm Beach	
530	County, Florida, on this the day of	, 2021.	
531 532 533 534 535	ATTEST: JOSEPH ABRUZZO, CLERK OF THE CIRCUIT COURT & COMPTROLLER	PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA, BY ITS BOARD OF COUNTY COMMISSIONERS	
536 537 538 539	By:	By: Dave Kerner, Mayor	
540 541 542	(SEAL)		
543 544 545 546	APPROVED AS TO FORM AND LEGAL SUFFICIENCY		
547 548 549	By:County Attorney		
550	Filed with the Department of State on the	day of, 2021.	